

Approved

**MINUTES
VILLAGE OF HINSDALE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
19 E. Chicago Avenue, Hinsdale, IL
[Meeting Conducted Electronically]
May 5, 2021
6:30 P.M.**

Call to Order & Roll Call

Chairman Bohnen called the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) to order at 6:30 p.m. The meeting was conducted electronically via Zoom, with a live audio stream of the meeting available to the public via Channel 6 and on the Village website.

Roll call was taken and a quorum was present at the meeting.

Present: Chairman John Bohnen, Commissioner Sarah Barclay, Commissioner Alexis Braden, Commissioner Bill Haarlow, Commissioner Jim Prisby, Commissioner Shannon Weinberger

Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

Also Present: Robb McGinnis, Director of Community Development; Bethany Salmon, Village Planner; Kathy Bono, Court Reporter

Approval of the Minutes – February 3, 2021

Chairman Bohnen introduced the minutes from the February 3, 2021, meeting and asked for comments. A motion was made by Commissioner Weinberger, seconded by Commissioner Haarlow, to approve the February 3, 2021 draft minutes as submitted. The motion carried by a roll call vote of 6-0 as follows:

Ayes: Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

Public Hearing – Certificate of Appropriateness

- a) **Case HPC-01-2021 – 13 S. Elm Street – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to Demolish a Single-Family Home in the Robbins Park Historic District and to Construct a New Single-Family Home**

Please refer to Attachment 1, for the transcript for Public Meeting Case HPC-01-2021.

Mike Conneely, the owner and builder, was present at the meeting to answer questions from the Commission. At the meeting, the Commission discussed that the proposed single-family home was not compatible with the existing houses on the block. The Commission did not oppose the demolition and noted that the split-level home was not architecturally significant.

A motion was made by Commissioner Prisby, seconded by Commissioner Weinberger, to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the house located at 13 S. Elm Street. The motion carried by a vote of 6-0 as follows:

Ayes: Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen
Nays: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

A motion was made by Commissioner Prisby, seconded by Commissioner Weinberger, to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new single-family home located at 13 S. Elm Street. The motion carried by a vote of 6-0 as follows:

Ayes: Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen
Nays: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

Public Meeting – Certificate of Appropriateness

a) Case HPC-02-2021 – 419 S. Oak Street – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to Allow for Changes to the Elevations of a New Single-Family Home in the Robbins Park Historic District

Julie Laux, from J Jordan Homes, on behalf of the homeowner, requested that the case be moved up on the agenda. Ms. Laux provided an overview of the requested changes, which included the addition of a new third floor dormer and leaving the brick natural rather than limewashing it. The plans also include changes to the windows on the north side of the building.

Commissioner Prisby commented that the changes to the building are a positive change and referenced changes to another house on Park Street that were similar to these changes. Commissioner Prisby noted that some of the details such as the chimney caps were standard and encourage removing cookie cutter features. Julie Laux noted the changes reflect the wishes of the homeowner and details like the chimney caps are not known at this time.

Commissioner Prisby noted that the Historic Preservation Commission does not have authority on changes to the building elevations and therefore cannot hold up their project.

Commissioner Haarlow noted that the changes to the windows on the north elevation are an improvement to the previously reviewed elevations.

A motion was made by Commissioner Haarlow, seconded by Commissioner Prisby, to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow for changes to a new single-family home located at 419 S. Oak Street. The motion carried by a vote of 6-0 as follows:

Ayes: Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen
Nays: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

b) Case HPC-03-2021 – 448 E. 6th Street – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to Allow for Changes to the Elevations of a New Single-Family Home in the Robbins Park Historic District

Mike Ryan, the owner and builder for the single-family home, provided an overview of the changes to the building. Mr. Ryan stated that there are several site plan changes, such as the driveway entrance location and window wells. There was a discussion on other minor changes, such as the removal of the parapet walls due to concerns over ice damming as well as changes to the dormer design and roofing material, windows, and building materials.

Commissioner Haarlow stated that the proposed changes to the dormers to be more similar in style provides a traditional look that is appropriate.

Commissioner Prisby noted that the original garage doors provided additional details and character to the home that has now been lost. Commissioner Braden also noted that the chevron pattern originally used on the garage doors were a nod to other Zook homes and was considered a loss in detail to the proposed home.

There was a discussion over the change to the design of the windows located within the arched front porch entry. Several commissioners noted that the addition of the brick column and changes to the front window created asymmetry. Mr. Ryan noted that they changed the window due to aesthetics and wanted to mirror the same size window used in the study on the house. Mr. Ryan stated he was open to removing the brick column that divides the window to help with the appearance of the front elevation. The Commissioners were in support of that change.

A motion was made by Commissioner Prisby, seconded by Commissioner Haarlow, to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow for changes to a new single-family home located at 448 E. 6th Street. The motion carried by a vote of 6-0 as follows:

- Ayes:** Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen
Nays: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

Sign Permit Review

a) Case A-03-2021 – 29 E. 1st Street – Egg Harbor Cafe – Installation of One (1) Wall Sign

John Streetz, representing the sign contractor Doyle Signs, provided a brief overview of the proposed signage plans for Egg Harbor Café. There was a discussion on the burgundy color and font used as part of the company branding, the existing lighting and illumination of the sign, and size of the lettering.

Several of the Commissioners expressed concern that the lettering appeared taller than the previous letters used for Harry and Eddie's and, as a result, the proposed sign appeared squeezed and lacked appropriate spacing around the text. The Commission recommend that the proposed font size be reduced. It was also noted that the sign will be illuminated by the existing light fixtures. No public comment regarding this request was made at the meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Haarlow, seconded by Commissioner Prisby, to recommend approval of the sign permit request for Case A-03-2021 for Egg Harbor Café located at 29 E. 1st Street, subject to the condition that the letters be made slightly smaller to increase spacing around the text. The motion carried by a vote of 6-0 as follows:

Ayes: Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen
Nays: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

b) Case A-06-2021 – 34 E. Hinsdale Avenue – Bake Homemade Pizza – Installation of One (1) Wall Sign

The applicant was not present at the meeting. Several of the Commissioners expressed concern that the applicant was not present and concern about the design, scale, and location of the sign.

Commissioner Prisby stated the proposed sign conflicts with the building's architecture due to its location in the brick area above the storefront window, which was never intended for signage and spacing near the centered brick rosette feature. The sign needs to match the scale of the building and fit with the architecture.

Several Commissioners also expressed concern regarding the proposed tagline, noting that the proposed sign appeared busy.

Commissioners Barclay and Weinberger also noted that the brick area is one of the charming features of the building and this sign did not fit well within the area.

The Commissioners discussed alternative options for signage, including permanent window signage, a sign in front of the window similar to that used at the nearby Starbucks, or a sign incorporated into a canopy/awning. No public comment was made at the meeting.

The Historic Preservation Commission recommended tabling the vote for the sign permit request for Case A-06-2021 for Bake Homemade Pizza located at 34 E. Hinsdale Avenue to the next meeting scheduled for July 7, 2021 by a vote of 6-0 where the applicant will be present to discuss the signage plans.

c) Case A-07-2021 – 10 E. 1st Street – Expression Gallery of Final Art – Installation of One (1) Wall Sign

The applicant from Concord Signs provided an overview of the proposed sign and answered questions from the Commissioners. The applicant noted that the business is relocating from another location in town and is proposing a new sign with a black metal background and gold vinyl text.

Commissioner Braden asked about how the vinyl lettering held up against the elements. The applicant noted that vinyl lettering holds up well to weathering, even though there may be discoloration over long periods of time due to the sun.

Commissioner Prisby asked if the facade background behind the sign was previously painted white and if any painting is proposed. The applicant stated that they are not proposing to repaint the

façade. Overall, the Commissioners were in support of the sign. No public comment was made at the meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Prisby, seconded by Commissioner Weinberger, to recommend approval of the sign permit request for Case A-07-2021 for Expression Gallery of Fine Art located at 10 E. 1st Street. The motion carried by a vote of 6-0 as follows:

Ayes: Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen
Nays: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

d) Case A-09-2021 – 48 S. Washington Street Unit 2 – Meredith Jay – Installation of One (1) Wall Sign

Cullen Fuller provided an overview of the proposed signage. The new letters will match the signage for the adjacent tenant in building, My Sister Kate, in terms of height and width of letters. Chairman Bohnen asked if the letters will be applied directly to the fascia of the building. Mr. Fuller confirmed they would be pin mounted directly to the fascia in the black area above the storefront windows.

Commissioner Prisby asked if the black area was to be repainted. Mr. Fuller confirmed they will paint the existing trim black/charcoal, which is the same color there now.

Overall, the Commissioners expressed support for the sign in terms of the font, size, color, and scale with the building. No public comment was made at the meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner Braden, seconded by Commissioner Weinberger, to recommend approval of the sign permit request for Case A-09-2021 for Meredith Jay located at 48 S. Washington Street Unit 2. The motion carried by a vote of 6-0 as follows:

Ayes: Commissioners Barclay, Braden, Haarlow, Prisby, Weinberger, and Chairman Bohnen
Nays: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Commissioner Frank Gonzalez

Public Comment

Chairman Bohnen asked for any public comments. There was no public comment pertaining to non-agenda items.

New Business - Discussion Items

a) Joint Committee of the Whole & Historic Preservation Commission to Discuss Title 14 Amendments

Bethany Salmon provided an overview of the meeting held at Committee of the Whole & Historic Preservation Commission on May 4, 2021. The intent of the meeting was to provide an overview for the Board of Trustees on the existing historic preservation regulations and processes to set the stage for future discussions on amendments to Title 14. The next anticipated meetings are to be

held before the regularly scheduled Board meetings. Ms. Salmon will send the anticipated dates of the meetings once we hear back from the Board on the tentative schedule.

At the meeting, there was a short discussion on if areas should be resurveyed or to update information, which could potentially be led by the Historic Preservation Commission or volunteers.

Commissioner Haarlow commented that he attended the meeting and it wasn't clear if they were supposed to participate or observe. Ms. Salmon clarified that the meeting yesterday was intended to provide an overview of where we are at and ask broad questions for the Board to consider. Future meetings are intended to more interactive and discussion based.

Commissioner Haarlow also stated that the last meeting minutes from February stated that it was intended for a referral be made to the Plan Commission in the next 30-60 days, but that this has not happened yet. It is hoped that we are not going back to square one and there was already a lot of previous effort put in by the Historic Preservation Commission with the Village hired consultant, Michael D'Onofrio.

Commissioner Haarlow stated that there does not seem to be a need for a new survey in terms of a cost and time perspective. The historic district already exists and we should be focusing on incentives as part of amendments to Title 14.

Commissioner Bohnen and Commissioner Braden commented that any resurveying efforts could be completed by volunteers or members of the Commission. Commissioner Prisby also has stated concerns with resurveying the historic district.

Commissioner Braden also commented that there should be additional focus on demolition by neglect and demolition delays put in place, as well as how the Village as a non-home rule community can legally put efforts such as these in place. Commissioner Braden agreed with Commissioner Haarlow that they are concerned that we are going back to the beginning.

There was a discussion on the next steps and the text amendment review process.

Chairman Bohnen suggested that the Historic Preservation Commission should specifically identify which homes should be protected so that we can pair down the number of sites. This would also save the Village money.

The Commissioners noted that presentation was well-done and could be used in the future to educate future Commissioners and the public. Commissioner Weinberger also commented that we may want to make sure that the work that Mike D'Onofrio did with the Historic Preservation Commission should be focused on and shared in future meetings.

There was also a discussion on contacting the Village attorney on if there will be any Open Meetings Act issues with Commissioners conducting surveys and not creating any violations of the Act.

b) Meeting Schedule

The regular meeting for the Historic is cancelled in June due to summer holiday schedules. The next regularly scheduled meeting is set for July 7, 2021.

c) Robbins Park Signage

Commissioner Haarlow commented that the last meeting minutes stated that Robb McGinnis would look into how soon funds would be made available for the HPC to move forward with the purchase of the Robbins Park Street Sign Toppers and that \$10,000 was available in this year's budget. Robb McGinnis stated that the Village is waiting to hear back on spending in regard to revenues and anything discretionary was put on hold until we hear back about the numbers.

Adjournment

A motion was made by Commissioner Weinberger, seconded by Commissioner Braden, to adjourn the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 8:28 p.m. after a unanimous voice vote of 6-0.

Respectfully Submitted,
Bethany Salmon, Village Planner