

**VILLAGE OF HINSDALE
PLAN COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
Wednesday, June 14, 2023**

The regularly scheduled meeting of the Village of Hinsdale Plan Commission was called to order by Chairman Cashman, in Memorial Hall of the Memorial Building, 19 E. Chicago Avenue, Hinsdale, IL on Wednesday, June 14, 2023 at 7:32 p.m., roll call was taken.

PRESENT: Commissioners Cynthia Curry, Jim Krillenberger, Julie Crnovich, Mark Willobee, Scott Moore, and Chairman Steven Cashman

ABSENT: Commissioners Laurel Haarlow, Gerald Jablonski, and Anna Fiascone

ALSO PRESENT: Bethany Salmon, Village Planner, Robert McGinnis, Director of Community and Development, Natalie Crown, Planning Intern

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items

Chairman Cashman asked for public comments. There were no public comments pertaining to non-agenda items.

Approval of Minutes – May 10, 2023

Hearing no comments, a motion was made by Commissioner Willobee, seconded by Commissioner Curry, to approve the May 10, 2023 draft minutes as submitted. The motion carried by the roll call vote of 6-0 as follows:

AYES: Commissioners Curry, Krillenberger, Crnovich, Willobee, Moore, and Chairman Cashman
NAYS: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: Commissioner Haarlow, Jablonski, and Fiascone

Findings and Recommendations

a) Case A-13-2023 – 5700-5717 Foxgate Lane – Exterior Appearance and Site Plan Review to allow for the installation of an entrance gate across Foxgate Lane for the Foxgate Subdivision in the R-5 Multiple Family Residential District

Hearing no comments, a motion was made by Commissioner Krillenberger, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to approve Case A-13-2023 – 5700-5717 Foxgate Lane – Exterior Appearance and Site Plan Review to allow for the installation of an entrance gate across Foxgate Lane for the Foxgate Subdivision in the R-5 Multiple Family Residential District. The motion carried by the roll call vote of 6-0 as follows:

AYES: Commissioners Curry, Krillenberger, Crnovich, Willobee, Moore, and Chairman Cashman
NAYS: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: Commissioners Haarlow, Jablonski, and Fiascone

Public Meetings

a) Case A-9-2023 – 11 Salt Creek Lane – MedProperties – Exterior Appearance and Site Plan Review to Allow for Changes to the Existing Building Elevations, Landscape Plan, and Site Plan at 11 Salt Creek Lane in the O-3 General Office District

David Dastur, architect from Jensen & Halstead, was present to describe the changes to the application since the Plan Commission meeting in March 2023. The material of the trash enclosure was changed from cedar to a composite material to match the transformer screening as requested and the front stoop has been made smaller allowing for more green space at the front entry.

Some design elements were taken from canopies on other buildings in Office Park and incorporated into the proposed plans. Different outdoor light fixtures and entry doors were selected and the window trim was modified slightly. The canopy for the entry door is similar to the building at 901 Elm, but will be white to match the trim and a smaller version with posts was chosen for one entrance.

Commissioner Curry felt the changes made were still more modern than the surrounding area.

Commissioner Krillenberger stated he liked the consistent look of the changes, that the proposed changes look great, as does the landscaping.

Commissioner Crnovich stated the changes were a much better fit with the proposed windows that the applicant had already purchased.

Commissioner Willobee asked about the acrylic canopy. Mr. Dastur stated it would probably have a slight tint to, they have used this product in other projects in the past, and requires little maintenance. Commissioner Willobee stated that he liked the landscaping and the slightly modern features.

Commissioner Moore asked about plans to clean the building where the previous portico was. Mr. Dastur stated the exact clean up method will be decided upon once the original porticos are removed. He believed a power wash or acid wash will be used and the newly exposed area should age and blend in fairly quickly. It was also stated the windows will not open.

Chairman Cashman stated the changes made will refresh the look of the building and blend in well with some other buildings in the area. Appreciation for the time and expense to make the changes was expressed by Commissioners.

A motion was made by Commissioner Curry, seconded by Commissioner Willobee, to approve Case A-9-2023 – 11 Salt Creek Lane – MedProperties – Exterior Appearance and Site Plan Review to Allow for Changes to the Existing Building Elevation, Landscape Plan, and Site Plan at 11 Salt Creek Lane in the O-3 General Office District. The motion carried by a roll call vote of 6-0 as follows:

AYES:	Commissioners Curry, Krillenberger, Crnovich, Willobee, Moore, and Chairman Cashman
NAYS:	None
ABSTAIN:	None
ABSENT:	Commissioners Haarlow, Jablonski, and Fiascone

b) Case A-07-2023 – 830 N. Madison Street – Salt Creek Club – Exterior Appearance and Site Plan Review to allow for the installation of two (2) paddle tennis courts on top of existing sports courts and the construction of a patio at 830 N. Madison Street in the OS Open Space District

Peter Coules, the attorney representing Salt Creek Club, stated the existing courts were unanimously approved in 2008 and the only new impervious space being proposed under this project is a patio that measures fifteen (15) by seventy-five (75) feet in size.

The paddle tennis court installation in this application will be installed directly over existing courts, resulting in no additional impervious space from the court alteration.

Mr. Coules stated the courts are located approximately six-hundred (600) feet away from the house to the south. The existing sport courts where the new paddle tennis courts are located is not well utilized. The area is already lit up at night, and the court modification will not result in an increase in number of members.

Commissioner Moore stated that he understands the proposal is utilizing the existing footprint and did not have any questions.

Commissioner Willobee asked what the current sport court is currently used for. Mr. Coules stated its current use is for kickball and basketball. It was stated that the lights turn off automatically at 10:30 p.m. and that there have been no noise violations to date for the court related activities.

Commissioner Crnovich asked for more detail about the shields on the lights. Mr. Coules responded all of the court lights will be fully shielded and will be 0.1 foot candles. The lights are controlled by a timer that is contained in a locked room that only staff has access to.

Commissioner Krillenberger asked what the purpose of the paver patio will be. Mr. Coules confirmed that it will not be used for activities, but rather a waiting area for the paddle courts and a space with seating and for belongings.

Commissioner Curry asked if the patio would contain a fire feature. Mr. Coules confirmed the fire feature would be used to keep members warm during the winter months. It was confirmed that the proposal does not contain any changes for the existing lights in the other areas. Mr. Coules stated that there was one neighbor complaint.

Chairman Cashman asked Mr. McGinnis to respond to some of the items of concern from a letter written by the resident of 915 N. Madison, Jeffrey Allen. The letter did not have concerns about the paddle court proposal but rather concerns involving other Club activities and areas. Mr. McGinnis responded the letter was received late in the day today, contained a lot of information, and staff has not had sufficient time to look into the concerns and make a site visit. It was noted that the Village Manager responded to Mr. Allen's email and Mr. McGinnis spoke with Mr. Allen late in the afternoon that day.

Chairman Cashman invited any members of the audience wishing to speak on this topic to step up to the podium and state their name.

Maria Shakir, resident of 543 Bonnie Brae Road, stated she was at a Commission meeting in 2008 related to the courts regarding noise and light disruptions. Ms. Shakir stated the police have been contacted in the past. Looking over the criteria of the application, she stated she had concerns with the height of the lights, the increased number of disruptions since 2001 as membership grew, and noise generated by the equipment in a game of paddle and pickle ball. Ms. Shakir stated that vehicles of club patrons have parked on the sidewalk preventing the safe use of public sidewalks.

Ms. Shakir shared photos showing the lights on outside of the proposed hours and that she has more examples of this. She stated the amount of noise has increased over time, members come and go as they please at all hours.

Ms. Shakir went to various Village parks with courts and all were quiet and peaceful at 9:30 pm. Other nearby clubs contacted ceased play at 9:00 or 9:30 pm. Ms. Shakir stated that she was told to go into the Police Department to file a complaint personally and go before a judge for every violation, a process that did not make sense for impacted residents. The noise and the lights have impacted the family's health negatively.

Kal Shakir, resident of 543 Bonnie Brae Road, stated he met with Club representatives before COVID. Mr. Shakir stated the Club currently has sixteen (16') foot tall lights and want twenty-four (24') feet for the new courts for matches to be scheduled, which would result in more people using the facilities than currently. Mr. Shakir stated that the Club never closes and the doors remain open to members at all times. Mr. Shakir offered to share a video of landscape crews beginning work at 7:00 am. The noise, which sometimes goes to 12 a.m. or 1 a.m., was described as unbearable. Mr. Shakir stated he calls the police to report the noise issues. It was stated that operational hours have changed drastically since the club opened, drainage is directed toward the neighboring properties, and sewage and the lack of a pond is problematic.

Mr. Shakir stated the club has 350 members and only 70 parking spots, and no employee parking. The large amount of street parking is a problem. He asked why the Village allows them to operate until 10:30 pm. and where the sound proof fence was in the plan that other pickle ball court locations require. The taller lights proposed in the plan would shine directly into Mr. Shakir's bedroom. Mr. Shakir stated that he was concerned with who was going to be responsible for the fire pit and the amount of grass that will be covered with the patio area and the destination of the water run-off. The audio of the meeting was disrupted for a period of time.

Discussion followed about neighborhood resident letters to inform the public about parking volume increases due to upcoming events, suggested hours of operation for the club, prior projects meeting stormwater codes, height of the light poles, the timer operating the lights, and lack of documentation resulting in police complaints.

Commissioner Krillenberger asked if the application can be paused until the legitimate, but unrelated, concerns are properly addressed. Chairman Cashman stated the Commission can recommend approval with conditions or the applicant can make suggested revisions to the application and return to a future meeting for a vote.

The applicant responded with inaudible comments.

Chairman Cashman re-stated the items of concern which included 1) Shields on existing lights, 2) timers instead of manual switches on the courts to prevent early starts or after hour play, and 3) the Club working with neighboring properties for large events.

Commissioner Willobee asked if there were any restrictions on the operations from the application in 2008. Staff replied that no restrictions could be identified. It was stated that the landscape and concerns and closing the gate, and sound proofing could not be addressed by this Commission. Those concerns fall outside of the areas able to be addressed by the Plan Commission.

A motion was made by Commissioner Willobee, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to continue Case A-07-2023 – 830 N. Madison Street – Salt Creek Club – Exterior Appearance and Site Plan Review to allow for the installation of two (2) paddle tennis courts on top of existing sports courts and the construction of a patio at 830 N. Madison Street in the OS Open Space District to the July 12, 2023 Plan Commission Meeting. The motion carried by a roll call vote of 6-0 as follows:

AYES: Commissioners Curry, Krillenberger, Crnovich, Willobee, Moore, and Chairman Cashman
NAYS: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: Commissioners Haarlow, Jablonski, and Fiascone

Sign Permit Review

a) Case A-15-2023 – Sign Permit Review – 100 S. Garfield Street – Hinsdale Middle School – Installation of One (1) Ground Signs, Six (6) Wall Signs, and Two (2) Flag Poles

Kerry Leonard, representative for District 181, and Mike Dugan, Facilities Manager of District 181, were present to address the Commission. Mr. Leonard stated that the concerns from the last meeting were taken to the District architect as well as the architect of the Middle School. Mr. Leonard very briefly summarized the changes that were made to the proposal based on Commission comments. The wall sign of concern will be re-located and lowered to make it code compliant, the blue ribbon emblem will be lowered and lighting reduced and ensure timers are properly functioning, lighting and noise of flagpole and internal lighting within the building. It was stated that the District is checking with the manufacturer of the flag pole for further sound dampening devices that can be purchased and installed specifically for that specific flag pole model. Mr. Leonard stated that any device available will be purchased and installed on the existing and proposed flag poles. Mr. Dugan has been in contact with vendors and contractors to modify the internal lighting system to reduce the amount of time the indoor lights are on. Renderings of the modifications were shared with the Commission.

Commissioner Curry asked if the flag could be lowered at dusk, perhaps by the boy scouts, to reduce the time the pole is making noise until a permanent solution is installed. She stated she is not fond of the second flag pole proposed location, it would be a lot of stuff too close to the street. Commissioner Curry suggested the location of the second pole be placed in a location to balance the first pole and the Illinois State flag or perhaps a Middle School flag be flown. Mr. Leonard replied that the location of the second pole is code compliant and was part of an original agreement with the Village. Mr. Leonard added that the flag poles and signage work together in school buildings to identify the main door.

Discussion followed about possible ways to make the north side of the building to look more like a main entrance.

Commissioner Curry asked if it was necessary to relocate sign five (5) to above the gymnasium, it seemed to be a lot of signage. Mr. Leonard responded that the letters would be a re-use of the existing letters and would assist directing unfamiliar drivers up to the parking deck to enter the building at the main door where visitors check in. By breaking up the ground sign, the wall sign, and the flagpole it adds to the confusion of the site. Commissioner Moore asked about locating the sign on the west side of the building.

Commissioner Krillenberger stated that he was in support of the project.

Commissioner Crnovich stated that during the time the school plans were being designed, school districts had a different set of standards than local ordinances and that was a confusing, transitional time. It was stated that the school district does need to comply with sign illumination between the hours of 10:00 pm and 7:00 am. Commissioner Crnovich stated that the signs were not part of the original plans and appreciates the district efforts to bring them into compliance and working with neighbors on the noise generated by the flagpole(s) that can be heard a block away. Commissioner Crnovich also suggested taking the flag down at dusk for the time being. She stated she is hopeful a solution can be determined for the wasteful and stark appearance of the internal lighting inside the building.

Commissioners Willobee and Moore echoed the comments made by Commissioners Curry and Crnovich.

Chairman Cashman is ok with the changes and acknowledged the importance of signage for the many visitors to this unique physical location.

Jim Oles, resident across the street from HMS, commented he did not see any shields on the plans for the monument sign. Mr. Leonard stated that the monument sign is lit from the bottom up and typically shields are utilized to reduce the amount of far reaching lighting on wall signs illuminated from above. Mr. Oles disagreed and suggested the shielding utilized on the Union Church monument sign as an excellent example.

A motion was made by Commissioner Krillenberger, seconded by Commissioner Curry, to approve Case A-15-2023 – Sign Permit Review – 100 S. Garfield Street – Hinsdale Middle School – Installation of One (1) Ground Signs, Six (6) Wall Signs, and Two (2) Flag Poles with the provisions that:

- 1) The flag be lowered at dusk until a noise reducing device is installed
- 2) Shields for the ground sign be investigated.

The motion carried by a roll call vote of 6-0 as follows:

AYES: Commissioners Curry, Krillenberger, Crnovich, Willobee, Moore, and Chairman Cashman
NAYS: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: Commissioners Haarlow, Jablonski, and Fiascone

Discussion followed about the recommendations passed along for the patio on the great lawn to the Village Board, the development of the plan, and the process possibly followed for approval.

Adjournment

Chairman Cashman asked for a motion to adjourn. A motion was made by Commissioner Krillenberger, seconded by Commissioner Moore, to adjourn the regularly scheduled meeting of the Village of Hinsdale Plan Commission of the June 14, 2023.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:18 PM after a unanimous voice vote of 6-0.

ATTEST: _____
Jennifer Spires, Community Development Office