

BIRMINGHAM HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 15, 2017
Municipal Building Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, November 15, 2017. Vice Chairman Keith Deyer called the meeting to order at 7 p.m.

Present: Board Members Doug Burley, Vice-Chairman Keith Deyer, Michael Willoughby; Alternate Board Members Adam Charles, Dulce Fuller

Absent: Chairman John Henke; Board Members Natalia Dukas, Thomas Trapnell; Student Representatives Josh Chapnick, Griffin Pfaff

Administration: Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

11-52-17

Vice Chairman Deyer took over as chair in the absence of Chairman Henke.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
HDC Minutes of October 18, 2017

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Mr. Burley to approve the HDC Minutes of October 18, 2017 as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Burley, Charles, Deyer, Fuller

Nays: None

Absent: Henke, Dukas, Trapnell

The Chairman noted that only five of seven board members were present this evening and four affirmative votes are needed to pass a motion. He offered the applicant the opportunity to adjourn their hearing to the next HDC meeting when a more full board might be present. The applicant wished to go forward.

11-53-17

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW
210 S. Old Woodward Ave.

**Vinoteca
CBD Historic District**

Zoning: B-4 Business Residential

Proposal: Mr. Baka explained the applicant is on the process of amending their Special Land Use Permit ("SLUP") with the City in order to change the name of the establishment from "The Bird and the Bread" to "Vinoteca." The tenant space is located in a two-story, multi-tenant non-contributing building in the CBD Historic District. The applicant proposes to install a new wall sign above the main entranceway to the restaurant and new awnings along the front elevation of the building. The sign is proposed to be suspended between the two existing columns in line with the existing sign band. The applicant is also proposing to enclose the existing outdoor dining space with Eisenglass.

The applicant appeared before the Planning Board on November 8, 2017. The Planning Board recommended approval of the proposal with the condition that the proposed Eisenglass enclosure be removed. The applicant is now requesting approval from the Historic District Commission before moving on for final approval from the City Commission.

Existing Signage: There are currently four other tenants with approved signage for the building for a total of 97.16 sq. ft.

Signage: The applicant proposes to replace the existing signage by installing a new wall sign above the main entranceway to the restaurant and by adding lettering to the new proposed awnings. The total linear building frontage is 130 ft. 5 in., permitting 130.5 sq. ft. sign area. The wall sign measures 13 sq. ft while the logo sign measures 7.8 sq. ft. The wall sign and the logo sign total 20.8 sq. ft.

The applicant is also proposing to install two new awnings with signage along the building frontage. The two awnings are constructed of fabricated aluminum tubing with Sunbrella black fabric non-illuminated skins. They have 3.88 in. applied white vinyl text in the 9 in. valences. Each valance is 8.125 sq. ft. total, while the proposed valance signage text totals 2.61 sq. ft. for each awning, satisfying the Sign Ordinance requirement in Section 1.05(B), Table B of no more than 33% of the valance area. This proposal would bring the total signage for the building to 123.2 sq. ft. In accordance with Article 1.0, section 1.04 (B) of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance, Combined Sign Area, that states for all buildings, including multi-tenant office or retail buildings, the combined area of all types of signs shall not exceed 1 sq. ft. (1.5 sq. ft. for addresses on Woodward Ave.) for each linear foot of principal building frontage.

The wall sign is proposed to be mounted more than 8 ft. 6 in. above grade. The projecting sign is proposed to be mounted 6 in. off the face of the column and 8.5 ft. above grade meeting the requirement of Article 1.0, Table B of the

Birmingham Sign Ordinance that states wall signs that project more than 3 in. from the building facade shall not be attached to the outer wall at a height of less than 8 ft. above a public sidewalk and at a height of less than 15 ft. above public driveways, alleys and thoroughfares.

The proposed wall sign background will be constructed of fabricated aluminum painted black. The letters will be $\frac{3}{4}$ in. push-thru acrylic dimensional letters reading "Vinoteca" with silver metallic faces. The entire sign will be mounted to wall plates attached with expansion bolts aligned to the mortar and will span the distance between the two columns that flank the front entrance to the establishment.

Illumination: The wall sign is proposed to be halo lit with internal white LED lights with a burgundy filter.

Design: The applicant is proposing to enclose the existing outdoor dining area with Eisenglass plastic similar to what is currently used at Market, Social Kitchen, and Café Via. The Eisenglass is proposed to be attached to a wooden frame constructed out of 2 x 6 ft. framing and clad with plywood that would be painted flat black. There would be 2 in. of continuous reveal on the top and sides. A 3 x 7 ft. wood door with clear plex is proposed on the north elevation with egress only that does not swing into the pedestrian entryway. No changes to the outdoor seating layout are proposed, the applicant is maintaining the same amount of tables and chairs as previously approved.

Chairman Deyer had three concerns:

- The Eisenglass;
- The information on the awning valances. In the past this commission has said the signage should identify the establishment and not be an advertisement for what they sell; and
- The awnings have a tendency to unbalance the building.

Ms. Fuller said she understands the Eisenglass because it is helpful to extend the outdoor dining season. At Cafe Via the Eisenglass takes a beating and loses its transparency. Mr. Willoughby noted this Eisenglass would be right on S. Old Woodward Ave.

Ms. Kristin Jonna, the restaurant owner, said they discussed this at length at the Planning Board and agreed to throw out the Eisenglass. Their reason for having it was to protect from the construction that they know is going to be happening for probably two years with the hotel coming in on their south facing side, and also the road construction. Their other reason was to create more energy up front on S. Old Woodward Ave. because they are so recessed that people don't know they are there. Their research for some alternative material has turned up only semi-permanent plastic or permanent glass.

Ms. Fuller said she would not be opposed if during construction they had Eisenglass between the restaurant and the hotel, because it is perpendicular to S. Old Woodward Ave.

Mr. Baka noted if this board decided to approve with that barrier they could, but the City Commission would also have to approve it. If it is denied by the HDC, it has to be appealed to the State because it is in a Historic District.

Ms. Jonna addressed the wording on the awnings. They have had problems at The Bird and the Bread with people seeing them and with people understanding what they are. So they feel like that little bit of writing is important. She offered to change the wording from "Elm Room Events Music" to something the commission would approve.

Chairman Deyer then suggested extending the awnings across the whole front facade to balance the building.

Mr. Willoughby thought there is room for a nice composition of the whole facade with little spurts of elements that identify an individual space. So, this awning doesn't bother him at all. Ms. Fuller added that it doesn't bother her.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Mr. Charles to not accept the Eisenglass for 210 S. Old Woodward Ave., Vinoteca, anywhere. He would recommend to the City Commission that they give leeway during the construction process so the south side of Vinoteca would be protected.

There was no discussion from members of the audience at 7:20 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Charles, Burley, Deyer, Fuller

Nays: None

Absent: Henke, Dukas, Trapnell

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Fuller to approve the rest of the proposal as submitted for 210 S. Old Woodward Ave., Vinoteca, with the understanding that there would be a change in the verbiage that would be administratively approved.

There was no discussion from members of the audience at 7:21 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Fuller, Burley, Charles, Deyer

Nays: None

Absent: Henke, Dukas, Trapnell

11-54-17

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

A. Staff Reports

-- Administrative Approvals

-- Violation Notices (none)

-- Demolition Applications

- 1288 Washington
- 1258 Washington
- 1273 Stanley
- 1735 Henrietta
- 1809 Holland
- 538 Southfield
- 1744 Derby
- 844 Pierce

B. Communications

-- Commissioners' Comments

10-51-17

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the commissioners motioned to adjourn the meeting at 7:24 p.m.

Matthew Baka
Sr. Planner