

BIRMINGHAM HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 2, 2016
Municipal Building Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, November 19, 2016. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.

Present: Chairman John Henke; Board Members Mark Coir, Natalia Dukas (arrived at 7:08 p.m.), Thomas Trapnell, Vice-Chairperson Shelli Weisberg, Michael Willoughby

Absent: Commission Member Keith Deyer; Student Representative Loreal Salter-Dodson

Administration: Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

11-57-16

APPROVAL OF MINUTES
HDC Minutes of October 5, 2016

Motion by Mr. Coir
Seconded by Mr. Willoughby to approve the HDC Minutes of October 5, 2016 as submitted.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Coir, Willoughby, Henke, Trapnell, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Dukas

Chairman Henke cautioned the petitioners that there were only five of seven board members present and four votes are needed to pass a motion. He offered them the opportunity to postpone their hearing to the next meeting in the hope there would be seven members present at that time. No one opted to postpone.

11-58-16

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW
539 S. Bates
United Presbyterian Parsonage

**Alterations to the existing historic home
Bates St. Historic District**

Zoning: R-3 Single-Family Residential

Proposal: Mr. Baka provided a history of events to this point. The applicant proposes to construct an addition and a two-story garage on a contributing historic house in the Bates St. Historic District. This application was previously approved at the June 6, 2012 HDC meeting. However, the owners at that time did not follow through with construction of the addition. A new prospective home owner appeared before the commission on August 3, 2016 to request renewed approval of the previous plan, which was granted. At that time the applicant indicated that they would return to the commission in the near future to request modifications to the original plan once they had finalized the purchase of the home.

In 2012, the HDC approved a large two-story addition on the back of the existing historic structure. The owners at the time never followed through with the approved addition. In August of 2016 a new prospective owner was granted a renewed approval of the previous addition. This was done prior to the formal purchase of the home in order to ensure that the previously approved addition would still be permitted. At that time the new owner, Mr. Michael Horowitz, indicated that he would likely be returning to the board to slightly modify the plans for the addition to better suit their needs. Accordingly, the applicant has now submitted revised plans requesting several changes to the site.

Design

Addition: The footprint of the addition to the house is proposed to be enlarged by 127 sq. ft. from the original approval to accommodate a new elevator and master bedroom suite. Also, the footprint of the garage is proposed to be enlarged 30 sq. ft. and the eave height to be raised 21 in.

These changes are to accommodate a ½ story storage area above the garage and an interior staircase. Along the rear of the new addition the applicant is now proposing to construct an uncovered raised porch made of Fendt Old World Holland tumbled paving brick in a “rustic blend” color.

In addition to the changes to the footprint of the addition, the applicant is also proposing several changes to the design and materials to be used. Shakertown cedar shingles are now proposed to be used on the addition and garage in place of the previously approved stucco finish. Also, the applicant is now proposing a 10 in. frieze board and simplified window and door casings. The color of the addition is proposed to be “Amherst Gray” on the cedar shake and the trim is proposed to be BM Pale Oak. The foundation of the addition and garage is now proposed to be concrete block parged with cement plaster painted SW 0077 “Classic French Gray.” The chimney is now proposed to be Michigan fieldstone.

Historic Resource: The changes proposed to the historic portion of the home include painting the existing Dolly Vardon Siding SW0077 – Classic French Gary (previously approved), and installing a new roof on the historic portion and the new addition using CertainTeed Landmark Pro Shingles in “Driftwood” color.

The applicant is also proposing to renovate the front porch by replacing the ceiling with tongue and groove, v-groove, painted BM “Amherst Gray.” The floor of the porch is proposed to be painted to match natural finish Ipe wood. The railing of the porch is proposed to be clear cedar clear-coated with polyurethane. The balusters are proposed to be painted BM Pale Oak OC-20. The proposal also calls for a new exterior light fixture with bronze finish and pearl mist glass.

Mr. Baka passed around a materials board.

Mr. Bill Finnicum, the architect, confirmed for the Chairman that the windows on the new addition will be aluminum clad. The Michigan fieldstone which is on the foundation of the existing structure is being used on the new structure for the chimney.

It was the consensus of the board members that this proposal looks a lot better than the previous submission.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Mr. Coir to approve the Historic Design Review for 539 S. Bates, United Presbyterian Parsonage, as submitted.

There were no comments from the public on the motion at 7:20 p.m.

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Coir, Dukas, Henke, Trapnell, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer

11-59-16

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

159 Pierce

Historic St. Clair Edison Building

CBD Historic District

Zoning: B-4 Business Residential

Proposal: Mr. Baka explained the applicant proposes to renovate the façade of the historic St. Clair Edison Building, a contributing resource in the CBD Historic District and to make some minimal site changes on the north, east and west elevations.

The work as stated in the applicant's written narrative is as follows: The applicant proposes to restore and paint all existing trim, restore and paint the main entrance door, sidelights and transom all in BM 1629, which is a light blue. The existing awning is proposed to be removed and replaced with three (3) new striped awnings in "Sapphire Blue" and "Parchment" and the existing railing is proposed to be replaced with a new brass cap iron railing. Also on the west elevation, the applicant proposes to replace existing steps and landings with limestone. A visual inspection of the existing limestone does show significant deterioration and does appear to justify replacement.

Further, the applicant proposes to restore and stain the red brick to its original color. The applicant has stated that the brick stain is being proposed due to the mismatched bricks that have been used over the years. The application of the stain will be to color the brick only; the mortar will be cleaned and remain white. The applicant also proposes to replace the two side doors that are perpendicular to the sidewalk with custom mahogany doors; the application states they will be similar to existing doors (exact specifications not provided).

In addition, the applicant also proposes to remove the existing display cases at the basement entry and replace the basement windows with new paned windows.

On the north elevation the applicant proposes to restore and stain the brick to original color. The glass block windows are proposed to be replaced with custom double pane windows and limestone sills. The existing downspouts and gutters are proposed to be replaced with new copper downspouts and gutters.

On the east elevation the applicant proposes to paint CMU; option to replace existing windows and sills with new windows and limestone sills; replace existing downspouts and gutters with new copper downspouts and gutters.

Signage: The applicant proposes to remove the existing building signage at the right side of the west elevation and add a Historic Designation sign on the left side of the west elevation.

Illumination: The applicant is proposing to install three (3) pendant lights on the west elevation and two (2) wall sconces, both made by Modern Forms Lighting Co.

Landscaping: On the west elevation the applicant is proposing to replace the existing landscaping curb with a new Belgium Block granite curb and new landscape beds with 12 in. high boxwood hedges and seasonal flowers.

Mr. Victor Saroki, Architect, explained for the Chairman that the windows will be all wood, either Marvin or Weather Shield. The railing will be cast iron that is

galvanized with a brass cap added across the top. He explained the stairs going down do not meet the full code compliant dimensions for the rise and the run. They propose to remove the concrete stairs, re-form them with new concrete stairs, and place limestone on top of them. That will provide a very elegant look going down. He plans to have a discussion with the Building Official prior to doing this work, because it may not turn out to be totally code compliant. If the Building Official is not in agreement, they may have to leave the concrete stairs going down as they are.

Their contractor will clean out the mortar joints and re-tuck point the brick. The brick stain will be completed by a company called Nockol so that it has a uniform look. The entrance door will be mahogany with brass kick plates. The railings will have a brass cap and the address in the transom window will be gold leaf. Planter boxes will be cleaned up and have a granite curb added. Spring and Fall plantings are planned for them. Everything will be limestone up to the City sidewalk.

It was decided that a sample of the brick stain could be put on the building

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Mr. Coir to approve the Historic Design Review for 159 Pierce, Historic St. Clair Edison Building as submitted conditioned on the following:

- **Plans to reflect limestone stairs;**
- **New windows will be Marvin or Window Shield;**
- **Brick stain sample area for review by the commission;**
- **Door specifications to be provided to the Planning Dept.**

There was no discussion on the motion from members of the public at 7:40 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Coir, Dukas, Henke, Trapnell, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer

11-60-16

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

A. Staff Reports

-- Administrative Approvals (none)

B. Communications

-- Commissioners' Comments (none)

11-61-16

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the commissioners motioned to adjourn the meeting at 7:41 p.m.

Matthew Baka
Sr. Planner