

BIRMINGHAM HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF AUGUST 16, 2017
Municipal Building Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, August 16, 2017. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7 p.m.

Present: Chairman John Henke; Board Member, Thomas Trapnell, Shelli Weisberg, Michael Willoughby; Alternate Board Member Adam Charles

Absent: Board Members Keith Deyer, Natalia Dukas; Alternate Board Member Dulce Fuller; Student Representatives Josh Chapnick, Griffin Pfaff

Administration: Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

08-37-17

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

HDC Minutes of July 19, 2017

Motion by Mr. Trapnell

Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to approve the HDC Minutes of May 3, 2017 as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Trapnell, Weisberg, Charles, Henke, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Dukas

The Chairman noted that only five of seven board members were present this evening. He offered applicants the opportunity to adjourn their hearing to the next HDC meeting when a more full board might be present. All applicants wished to be heard this evening.

08-38-17

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

607 Bates
Major Jones House
Bates St. Historic District

Zoning: R-3 Single-Family Residential

History: Mr. Baka noted the house was designated historic in 1978 and the Bates St. Historic District designation came into effect in January of 1998. The house has been sold several times and reviewed by the HDC for potential renovations. However, none of those approved plans were executed, and the current owner is seeking to renovate the property with a new proposal.

Proposal: The existing two-story portion of the 1865 structure is proposed to be fully restored, with all architectural detail retained and preserved. The single-story 691 sq. ft. non-contributing rear portion of the house is proposed to be removed. A large wing addition is planned for the rear and the south elevations. Also, a recently constructed, non-contributing canopy over an existing basement door on the north side is proposed to be removed.

On June 21, 2017, the applicant appeared before the HDC seeking approval of an addition to the Major Jones House. The application was approved with the exception of the front porch. The commission requested that the applicant consider altering the design in a way that accentuates the original portion of the home and its detail features. Accordingly, the applicant has submitted revised plans. The new plans have altered the ceiling of the wrap around roof so that it projects upward at an angle in order to reveal the angled window at the southwest corner of the original structure. Currently, this window is concealed within the existing enclosed porch. The applicant is now proposing to expose this window and restore the decorative wood details shown in the historic photos available for the house.

In addition, the applicant was granted the required variances at the July 11, 2017 Board of Zoning Appeals meeting to construct the copula and the gable ends that had previously been identified as dormers.

Mr. William Finnicum, Finnicum Brownlie Architects, was present, but no one had questions for him.

Motion by Ms. Weisberg
Seconded by Mr. Charles to issue a Certificate of Approval for the Design Review application for 607 S. Bates. The work meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings standard number 9.

Motion carried, 5-0.

There were no comments from members of the public on the motion at 7:05 p.m.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Charles, Henke, Trapnell, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Dukas

08-39-17

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

415 W. Merrill

New Abigail Carter House Garage and Design Changes to Home

Zoning: R-8 Multiple-Family Residential

History: The oldest portion of the Carter house dates to 1884. At some point a second story was added. The house was reportedly moved in 1918 to make room for Baldwin High School. The Carter family occupied the house until 1950. The home was then used as a boarding house for many years. The house was designated historic in 1983 at the age of 99.

Proposal: The applicant is proposing to construct a detached carriage house-style garage with a cross gable roof south of the historic home at 415 W. Merrill. The proposed garage will accommodate two cars on the first floor and contain habitable attic space on the second floor. The proposed garage will be set back 14.88 ft. from the principal building and at least 4 ft. from each lot line to satisfy the setback requirements. Additionally, the proposed garage appears to have an eave height of 8 ft. above grade. The applicant has indicated that the garage will be closely detailed to match the historic features of the existing historic house. The applicant is also proposing to make alterations to the existing historic house. Some of these changes include the construction of a pergola, enclosure of the existing back porch, relocation of a staircase, and the addition/alteration of windows.

New Garage: The east elevation of the proposed garage will consist predominantly of two separate entrances for two cars. Each entrance will be enclosed with its own garage door containing two clerestory windows. As demonstrated in the submitted plans, the proposed garage will face S. Chester where it will be made accessible by a driveway connecting to the street. The applicant is also proposing one double-hung, vertically-proportioned window. The north elevation will feature two double hung windows and one entry door with a pitched roof awning. At the second story, the applicant is proposing one larger double-hung window. The west elevation will predominantly consist of blank siding with the exception of one double-hung window featured on the second story.

Lighting: The applicant is proposing to install nine 8 in. x 10 in. x 24 in. traditional coach light fixtures with a 60 watt lumen on the garage. In addition, the applicant is proposing to install three lighting receptacles: one at the north front door; one at the east side dust porch; and one at the south entry porch. The applicant must demonstrate the location of each of the proposed light fixtures and receptacles in plans and submit specifications sheets for the indicated traditional coach light fixtures.

Mr. Kevin Hart, Architect for the homeowners, Virginia and Michael Geheb, came forward to propose adding two fixed windows to the second story of the west elevation as well as a double hung window on the first floor closer to the southwest corner of the house.

The plans demonstrate the relocation of a staircase to provide access to the south entry of the proposed enclosed porch. Their proposal will increase the grass and pervious surface on the site.

Mr. Willoughby suggested changing the height of the lap on the garage. It is 4 in. on the house. It would be interesting to do 8 in. on the garage. Mr. Hart agreed and said that would fall within the spirit of differentiation when adding on to a historic property.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to approve the Historic Design Review for 415 W. Merrill as submitted save for the architect's discretion to modify the size of the siding and corner boards on the garage. Architect to submit a new drawing.

Motion carried, 5-0.

There were no comments on the motion from members of the audience at 7:23 p.m.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Weisberg, Charles, Henke, Trapnell

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Dukas

08-40-17

FINAL HISTORIC SIGN/ DESIGN REVIEW

166 W. Maple Rd.

Caruso Caruso

Central Business Historic District

Zoning: B-4 Business Residential

Mr. Baka recalled the applicant was approved at the June 15, 2016 HDC meeting to renovate the front façade of the one-story commercial structure at 166 W. Maple Rd., Caruso Caruso with the exception of signage. The commission requested that the applicant return to the board with more detail regarding the lighting proposed for the sign. However, as it has more than one year since the date of the original approval the applicant must now renew the original approval in addition to the additional information on signage. The new proposal is identical to the previous approval with exception of the signage, which the Commission reviewed briefly at the 2016 meeting.

Design: The applicant is proposing to renovate the facade of the Leonard Building, a contributing resource in the Central Business District Historic District, by replacing the storefront window system and doors, adding new signage and replacing the ground stone tile at the entrance way. The storefront window system is proposed to be a protruding white anodized aluminum portal frame built into the existing opening with concealed back-lighting. Black power-coated clad mullions are proposed for the window bays and the existing columns are proposed to be painted black to match. The new doors are proposed to be frameless glass entry doors. The existing stone base is proposed to be clad in black granite. Finally, the ground stone along the ground at the storefront is proposed to be replaced with new black and white 1 in. hexagon tiles. One concern that has been identified is there is currently a Fire Department connection at the east end of the storefront. It appears that the new storefront design will interfere with this connection. The Fire Marshall will need to review and approve this design or any changes to the connection prior to a Building Permit being issued.

Signage: The applicant is now proposing to eliminate existing signage and replace it with the 2 ft. x 5 ft. back lit sign with four logos on a double-faced, edge-lit white acrylic sign. The sign would depict a heart, an image of the state of Michigan, a peace sign, and a face. The logos are proposed to be ½ in. thick anodized aluminum letters painted black that are 1 ft. 3 in. tall. In addition, the applicant is proposing to install a small blade sign at the west end of the storefront. The lettering on the blade sign is proposed to read “Caruso Caruso.”

The total linear building frontage is 36 ft. 8 in. permitting 36.66 sq. ft. of sign area. The proposed wall sign is proposed to be 10 sq. ft. The blade sign is proposed to be 3 sq. ft. per side for a total of 6 sq. ft. The total area of all the signs proposed is 16 sq. ft. which is in accordance with Article 1.0, section 1.04 (B) of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance, Combined Sign Area - For all buildings, including multi-tenant office or retail buildings, the combined area of all types of signs shall not exceed 1 sq. ft. (1.5 sq. ft. for addresses on Woodward Ave.) for each linear foot of principal building frontage.

The submitted plans indicate a mounting height of 8 ft. for all signage which meets the requirements of Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance - Wall signs that project more than 3 in. from the building facade shall not be attached to the outer wall at a height of less than 8 ft. above a public sidewalk and at a height of less than 15 ft. above public driveways, alleys and thoroughfares.

In accordance with Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance – Projecting Signs, projecting signs (wall mounted) shall have a maximum area of 15 sq. ft. total. The proposal meets this requirement. The proposed sign will have a 6 in. separation from the wall face and will be mounted 8 ft. above the grade. In accordance with Article 1.0, Section 1.05 (I)(2), a projecting sign shall have a minimum 6 in. separation between the sign and the wall. Additionally: In accordance with Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance – Projecting Signs, projecting signs (wall mounted) shall be mounted at the sign band and no less than 8 ft. above grade. The proposal meets these requirements.

Illumination: The existing goose neck lamps are proposed to be removed. The new portal frame surrounding the windows is proposed to contain concealed LED back lights. The specifications on the concealed lighting were not included with the plans.

Ms. Jennifer Kasselmann, Architect, said they propose to remove the gooseneck lamps that are not original to the building. The portal will be internally illuminated from the inside of the store with a soft glowing light.

Motion by Ms. Weisberg

Seconded by Mr. Willoughby to approve the Final Historic Sign/ Design Review for 166 W. Maple Rd., Caruso Caruso as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Willoughby, Charles, Henke, Trapnell

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Dukas

08-41-17

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

A. Staff Reports

-- Administrative Approvals

- 1158 W. Maple Rd. - Landscaping plan.
- 189 Townsend - Install one wall sign approximately 24 in. x 114 in. on the north elevation.
- 100 S. Old Woodward Ave., Woodward Development Company, LLC - As-built drawing showing windows on alley wall.

-- Violation Notices (none)

-- Demolition Applications

- 893 Hazel
- 1494 Webster
- 2792 Dorchester
- 325 Baldwin
- 1996 Webster
- 1323 Bennaville
- 592 Woodland
- 500 Arlington
- 1497 Stanley
- 811 Smith
- 1407 Stanley
- 574 Westchester
- 376 Baldwin

B. Communications

-- Commissioners' Comments

08-42-17

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the commissioners motioned to adjourn the meeting at 7:31 p.m.

Matthew Baka
Sr. Planner