

**DRAFT**  
**BIRMINGHAM HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**  
**MINUTES OF JULY 19, 2017**

Municipal Building Commission Room  
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

---

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, July 19, 2017. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7 p.m.

**Present:** Chairman John Henke, Board Members Mark Coir, Keith Deyer, Thomas Trapnell, Vice Chairperson Shelli Weisberg, Michael Willoughby (arrived at 7:10 p.m.); Alternate Board Member Adam Charles Dulce Fuller (left at 7:28 p.m.),

**Absent:** Board Member Natalia Dukas; Student Representatives Josh Chapnick, Griffin Pfaff

**Administration:** Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner  
Sean Campbell, Asst. City Planner  
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

**07-28-17**

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**HDC Minutes of May 3, 2017**

**Motion by Ms. Weisberg**

**Seconded by Mr. Coir to approve the HDC Minutes of May 3, 2017 as presented.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

**VOICE VOTE**

Yeas: Weisberg, Charles, Coir, Deyer, Fuller, Henke, Trapnell

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas, Willoughby

**HDC Minutes of June 21, 2017**

**Motion by Ms. Weisberg**

**Seconded by Mr. Coir to approve the HDC Minutes of June 21, 2017**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Charles, Coir, Deyer, Fuller, Henke, Trapnell

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas, Willoughby

**07-29-17**

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW**

**607 Bates**

**Major Jones House**

**Bates St. Historic District**

Requested to be postponed.

**Motion by Ms. Weisberg**

**Seconded by Ms. Fuller**

**To postpone the Historic Design Review for 607 Bates, Major Jones House to August 16, 2017.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Fuller, Charles, Coir, Deyer, Henke, Trapnell

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas, Willoughby

**07-30-17**

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW**

**100 S. Old Woodward Ave.**

**Wachler Building lighting**

**CBD Historic District**

Zoning: B-4 Business Residential

Proposal: Mr. Baka recalled that on February 04, 2015 the applicant was approved to renovate the exterior of 100 S. Old Woodward Ave. This approval included the conditional approval of the accent light around the parapet of the building and the decorative fin lights attached to the façade. The HDC granted the approval with the caveat that once the renovation was completed the applicant must return to the commission for a final review and approval of the lighting. Accordingly, the renovations have been completed and the property owner is now requesting that the HDC grant full approval of the lighting so that they may obtain a full Certificate of Occupancy from the City.

The applicant has provided photographs demonstrating the subdued level of intensity provided by the lighting. In addition the commission members were encouraged to make a site visit in the evening hours to observe the new lighting in person.

Lighting: The applicant installed 20 ft. 8 in. decorative backlit aluminum fins that are mounted vertically on the granite pillars along the north and west elevations. The fins are mounted near the top of the first floor windows and extend upwards to just above the roof line. Along the top of the roof line the applicant installed accent lighting that runs the length of the building. All lighting is LED.

Board members thought the lighting looks good.

Mr. Sam Surnow, the developer, thanked the commission for their approval. He was happy to work with the City and stated that he incorporated into his project many of the ideas he received.

**Motion by Ms. Fuller**

**Seconded by Mr. Coir to approve the Historic Design Review for 100 S. Old Woodward Ave., Wachler Building lighting.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Fuller, Coir, Charles, Deyer, Henke, Trapnell, Henke

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas, Willoughby

**07-31-17**

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW**

**277 Pierce**

**Five story mixed-use building**

**CBD Historic District**

Zoning: B-4/D-4

Proposal: This non-contributing resource is located at the corner of E. Merrill and Pierce. The property consists of one vacant single-story commercial building, formerly the Varsity Shop. The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing structure to replace it with a five-story, 27,000 sq. ft. mixed-use development with fifth floor residential.

The HDC is being asked to review the design of the development and its adherence to the historical character of the other areas in the District in regards to massing scale and design.

On August 3, 2016 the HDC approved the demolition of the existing building. The building has received Community Impact Study ("CIS") and Preliminary Site Plan Approval from the Planning Board.

Mr. Willoughby arrived at this time and replaced Ms. Fuller.

Design: The applicant is proposing to construct a five-story mixed-use commercial building. Level 1 will be used for retail, levels 2-4 will be commercial office spaces, and the fifth floor is to be residential.

#### *South (Side) Elevation*

The south elevation fronts 97 ft. along E. Merrill St. The façade begins with a stone base and continues upward to the fifth floor with brick. The windows and doors are clad in aluminum. The pedestrian entrance is near the alley and features a stainless steel and glass canopy and a doorway surrounded by stainless steel cladding. Also featured is a section of the steel and glass canopy that wraps around the corner at Pierce. The recessed fifth floor is protected by a metal guardrail with a metal canopy over the windows. There will be signage present for the retail tenant along this façade. As required in Article 3, Section 3.01 of the Zoning Ordinance, the applicant has provided glazing calculations proposing the required 70% glazing on the first floor and 33% as the highest percent of glazing on the upper floors.

#### *East (Front) Elevation*

The east elevation faces an alley. The two-car garage for the residential unit is proposed to open up into the alley, along with two service doors. The building materials are brick with several aluminum clad windows.

#### *West (Rear) Elevation*

The building materials and design along the west elevation are consistent with those described for the south elevation. The west elevation fronts Pierce and also features a pedestrian entrance along with the steel and glass canopy that wrapped around from the south elevation.

Again, as required in Article 3, Section 3.01 of the Zoning Ordinance, the applicant has provided glazing calculations exceeding the required 70% glazing on the first floor (72.4%) and 34.7% as the highest percent glazing on the upper floors.

#### *North (Side) Elevation*

Lastly, the north elevation abuts the adjacent property, Streetside Seafood. This elevation is required to be left blank, or have fire rated windows based on fire

codes for the City. Thus, the building material is brick all the way to the roofline of the fifth floor with no windows. The only architectural feature is the recessing of some brick.

Mr. Deyer remarked that the north elevation seems pretty stark.

Mr. Victor Saroki, Architect for the proposed building, was present with Ms. Evan Yaldo, Project Architect in his office. Mr. Saroki said they have as much glass as permitted by the Ordinance. The site is 56 ft. wide x 96 ft. deep. They are building to the property line and their north wall abuts Streetside Seafood. Fire rated windows if they were to be installed on the north side are thick, not clear vision glass and not attractive. Therefore they are using two colors of brick with a small recess just to give the wall some articulation. They intentionally loaded the mechanical and egress necessities on that north wall to keep the plan as open as they could on the other three walls.

Mr. Saroki passed around a materials board and described where they would be used. Signage will be located within the sign band.

Mr. Deyer was surprised they did not use more limestone on the building to provide accents and give it more visual interest. Mr. Saroki replied that Mr. Kojanian wants the articulation to be in the windows and the massing. He likes the simplicity of the brick.

Several commission members were in agreement that the building has a very industrial look for Pierce St.

**Motion by Mr. Coir  
Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to accept the Historic Design Review for 277  
Pierce as presented.**

There were no comments from members of the public at 7:28 p.m.

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Coir, Weisberg, Charles, Deyer, Henke, Trapnell, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas

**07-32-17**

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW  
535 W. Merrill  
Daisy Benedict House**

Zoning: R-3 Single-Family Residential

History: Mr. Baka advised the Daisy Benedict House was built around 1868 by Henry Benedict and later occupied by his Daughter, Daisy. In the early 1920s a hipped roof wing was added to the west side using an existing accessory building. In 1971 the property gained local notoriety as the location of Birmingham's last original out-house, which was sold for \$1 to a home owner from Orchard Lake. In the early 1980s the house was at the center of a local controversy involving the redevelopment of historically designated properties. Local outcry called for the preservation of the house, while the owner intended to convert the house and adjacent properties into condos. Eventually, the owner was allowed to move ahead with his project.

Proposal: The homeowner is requesting approval to make updates and repairs to correct the deteriorating conditions of several windows, trim molding, siding and entry porch. In addition to the proposed repairs, the applicant is requesting approval to replace the existing metal entry door with a Simpson wood and glass, six pane door and new lockset. Eight windows and storms along the front elevation of the house are proposed to be replaced with Marvin Ultimate four pane double hung windows. Existing aluminum gutters are proposed to be replaced with new copper gutters. The front porch is proposed to be rebuilt using Ipe Decking, Azak Composite Decking and treated framing. The applicant wants to redo the roof of the porch with standing seam copper and replace the light fixture.

**Generally speaking the proposed changes appear to be in keeping with the historic character of the home; however, several deteriorating elements are proposed to be replaced with new material rather than repairs as specified by Standard Number 0 of the U.S. Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.**

**The photos submitted by the applicant do not provide sufficient detail to determine if these elements are beyond the point of repair. Accordingly, the applicant has been asked to provide additional evidence of the need for replacement rather than repair.**

**Further, finish colors need to be provided for the door, windows, siding, and porch.**

Mr. Tom Hoffman, contractor for the project said their main goal is to remedy the defects. They would like to use LP Smart Side which is an engineered siding product. The new door and lockset have a historical look, very similar to a historical photo of the house. They are not changing any of the details on the house. They will not make any changes in paint colors.

Mr. Deyer noticed the tear sheet show two over one windows but the write-up that was provided says four over four. With regard to the siding which will only be done on the front, Mr. Hoffman said they will use Azak painted trim boards at the corners. The porch railing will be painted wood.

The chairman said they will need the correct tear sheets on the windows.

**Motion by Ms. Weisberg**

**Seconded by Mr. Willoughby to approve the Historic Design Review for 535 W. Merrill, Daisy Benedict House, conditioned upon submission of a tear sheet on the windows and painted wood railing on the front porch.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Willoughby, Adams, Coir, Deyer, Henke, Trapnell

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas

**07-33-17**

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW**

**556 W. Maple Rd.**

**Allen House**

**Birmingham Historical Park**

**Mill Pond Historic District**

Zoning: PP, Public Property

Proposal: Mr. Baka provided background. The Allen House and Birmingham Historical Museum is a contributing resource in the Mill Pond Historic District. The Allen House was built in 1928 by Harry and Marion Clizbe Allen. Mr. Allen was the first Mayor of the City of Birmingham when it incorporated in 1933.

The house and surrounding land were sold to the City in 1969. Mrs. Marion Allen was allowed to live in the house until her death in 1973. At that point, the City converted the house to a Community Center used primarily for wedding and other rental events. In 1999, the City and the Birmingham Historical Society worked out the arrangement to create the Birmingham Historical Museum. The museum opened on May 19, 2001.

The applicant is proposing to make numerous repairs and improvements to the subject building. It is of note that the applicant is proposing to make use of cedar shake shingles to match the existing siding, as well as apply a satin paint to be consistent with the original color. The proposed material would be installed to replicate the existing appearance of the building as closely as possible. All other proposed work will not alter the existing appearance.

Design: The applicant is proposing to make use of the following materials:

- Cedar shake shingles for siding
- Western Red Cedar with a semi-gloss for finish carpentry (exterior trims and sills)
- Free-form PVC for plastic synthetic wood trim (trims, sills, beadboard, and molding)
- Valspar Duramax satin exterior grade latex acrylic finish for shingles
- Valspar Duramax semi-gloss for trims, moldings, doors, and windows
- Valspar Duramax gloss for metal roof
- #97 AF Fibered Aluminum roof coating

At this time, the applicant is proposing to replace the siding on all dormers with new cedar shake shingles painted with a satin acrylic paint to match the existing body color. The applicant will also install new shingle siding at numerous locations on the exterior walls as bolded in the plans. All proposed replacements to the wooden trims on the building exterior will be constructed of western red cedar wood. Conversely, damaged wood cornice moldings, wood window sills, and fascia will be removed and replaced with synthetic wood components of identical shape, size, and finish. The plans also demonstrate the replacement of the muntin moldings within the north elevation at glazing to match existing. The applicant is proposing to re-coat the existing metal roof at the north elevation balcony with a gloss finish. Lastly, the applicant is proposing to repair the base of the front porch columns using synthetic wood and to add composite trims to match existing profiles.

It was noted the applicant took the commission's advice from their last review and they are using real cedar shake shingles for siding and painting them

**Motion by Mr. Deyer**

**Seconded by Mr. Willoughby to approve the Historic Design Review for 556 W. Maple Rd., Allen House, as they did everything the commission asked them to do.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Deyer, Willoughby, Charles, Coir, Henke, Trapnell, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas

**07-34-17**

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW**

**Mill Pond Historic District public art project**

Mr. Campbell represented the Public Arts Board and discussed the proposal. On April 19, 2017 the Public Arts Board ("PAB") reviewed a map and list of potential sites for public art. He provided an overview of the process that lead to the creating of the maps. The PAB discussed each location on the map and determined whether each one is of low, medium, or high priority.

On May 2, 2017, the Public Arts Board prioritizations were presented to the Parks and Recreation Board who formally voted to accept the map of locations and stipulated that any sculptures proposed within public parks would require their review and approval.

Staff has found that six proposed sites are located within the Mill Pond Historic District. These locations have been selected in concept only. Of the six sites, three are low priority, two are medium priority and one is high priority. The HDC must review and approve any sites the Public Arts Board recommends for public art installations in a Historic District.

Commission members stated they would be comfortable with considering some sort of art installation at the prescribed locations in the Mill Pond Historic District once they understand what the art is.

Mr. Coir thought artists will vie for the choice positions. However, Mr. Campbell said they must be agreed upon by the various boards. Mr. Campbell advised the Birmingham Bloomfield Cultural Council holds fundraisers that generate money to insure the sculptures that are on loan. The City pays for the insurance on City-owned art.

**Motion by Mr. Coir**

**Seconded by Ms. Weisberg that the commission thinks it is proper and fitting to have these sites designated for placement of sculpture.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

**VOICE VOTE**

Yeas: Coir, Weisberg, Charles, Deyer, Henke, Trapnell, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Dukas

**07-35-17**

**MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS**

**A. Staff Reports**

-- Administrative Approvals (none)

- Violation Notices (none)
- Demolition Applications (none)

**B. Communications**

- Commissioners' Comments

It was discussed the plaques designating historic buildings Downtown are in need of repair. Mr. Baka agreed to find out if there is money for that in the budget.

Mr. Coir announced this will be his last meeting with this group because he is moving to Florida.

Chairman Henke asked that Code Enforcement be sent out for the additional lighting on the top floor of Social.

**07-36-17**

**ADJOURNMENT**

No further business being evident, the commissioners motioned to adjourn the meeting at 8:10 p.m.

Matthew Baka  
Sr. Planner