

**BIRMINGHAM HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF MAY 16, 2018**

Municipal Building Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, May 16, 2018. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

Present: Chairman John Henke; Board Members Adam Charles, Vice-Chairman Keith Deyer, Michael Willoughby; Alternate Board Members Kevin Filthaut, Dulce Fuller

Absent: Board Members Doug Burle, Natalia Dukas, Thomas Trapnell

Administration: Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

05-12-18

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES
HDC Minutes of April 4, 2018**

**Motion by Mr. Willoughby
Seconded by Chairman Henke to approve the HDC Minutes of April 4, 2018
as presented.**

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas:

Nays: None

Absent: Burle, Dukas, Trapnell

The Chairman cautioned the petitioners that since only five board members were in attendance, they could postpone their hearing to the next meeting when a more complete board might be present. All agreed to go forward this evening.

05-13-18

**HISTORIC REVIEW
607 Bates
Major Jones House
Bates St. Historic District**

Zoning: R-3 Single-Family Residential

History: The Historic Major Jones House is located on the north half of a large lot at 607 S. Bates. The south half of the lot is vacant. The Historic Major Jones House was constructed in 1865 and is believed to be one of the oldest homes in the Bates St. Historic District. The house was designated historic in 1978 and the Bates St. Historic District designation came into effect in January of 1998.

The house served as a two-unit rental property for several years, and it has been vacant for many years. In 2003, the owner was cited for maintenance violations, and in 2006, after making several requests to demolish the property, the owner was cited for Demolition – by - Neglect (DXN). The owner was required to make several repairs to upgrade the condition of the house. The house has been sold several times and reviewed by the HDC for potential renovations. However, none of those approved plans were executed, and the current owner was approved to renovate the property with a new proposal.

Approval History: On June 21, 2017, the applicant appeared before the Historic District Commission seeking approval of an addition to the Major Jones House. The application was approved with the exception of the front porch. The Commission requested that the applicant consider altering the design in a way that accentuates the original portion of the home and its detail features.

Accordingly, the applicant submitted revised plans in August of 2017. The applicant was approved on August 16, 2017 to expose the window and restore the decorative wood details shown in the historic photos available for the house.

In addition, the applicant was granted the required variances at the July 11, 2017 Board of Zoning Appeals meeting to construct the copula and the gabled ends that were previously identified as dormers.

Proposal: The applicant is now returning to the commission to request additional modifications to the approved plan. The following changes are proposed:

- Change of window color;
- Change of roofing color;
- Add glass block windows;
- Replace masonry apron on porch with lattice for ventilation;
- Combine two kitchen windows into one;
- Replace stone wall with wood fence and 10 ft. arborvitae;
- Replace original windows;
- Replace original wood siding.

On April 4, 2018 the HDC reviewed and approved the proposed changes to the approved plan with the exception of the removal of the original siding and windows. The applicant requested that portion of the proposal be postponed to a

later date in the hopes that a full board would be in attendance. Accordingly, the applicant is now requesting approval of the remainder of the proposed changes.

Chairman Henke noted the board has not received any evidence of window and siding deterioration since the last meeting.

Mr. William Finnicum, the architect, was present with the homeowners, Mr. and Mrs. Joseph Angileri. Mr. Finnicum noted the house, currently under construction, has no house wrap, vapor barrier, insulation, or flashing to protect the walls. He took Chairman Henke's advice from the last meeting and consulted a window expert, Mr. James Turner, who walked him through the process of rebuilding an old window.

Their other option is to have windows made new to replicate the original. They would be primed and painted and have integral flashing installing to the wall. Glazing from the old windows would be used. The tie breaker for these windows is the addition of flashing and no exposure to lead paint. Mr. Finnicum felt the newer windows would have more durability over the years. Also, if they rebuild four existing windows, two more replacements would be needed anyway.

With respect to siding, the original has a 3/4 in. overlap which is not enough. The house has two types of siding. He would like to replace with siding that has more overlap which will give it more integrity. They will not change anything or take away any of the architectural features. The original siding must be removed in order to install a house wrap, get flashing between the edges of the windows and the house, and add insulation.

Chairman Henke maintained that the original windows can be rebuilt.

Mr. Finnicum projected a PowerPoint that showed the rotted siding with deterioration around the nails where moisture has gotten in. He followed that with pictures of historic homes in Birmingham where the original siding has been replaced:

- 571 S. Bates
- 612 S. Bates
- 347 W. Brown
- 384 W. Brown
- 536 Stanley
- 555 Stanley
- 587 Stanley
- 1119 Southfield

He felt these set adequate precedent for replacing original siding. If the original siding on this house is put back now, it will just have to be redone in the future.

Mr. Angileri spoke to say that he doesn't think anything they are proposing is contrary to the ordinances. They are trying to make the home efficient and bring it up to the characteristics of the neighborhood. When it comes to the windows, they don't think the new windows will affect exterior appearance. The siding is different. The old wood has to be taken off and may get broken in the process.

Chairman Henke noted the HDC's mandate is to keep the historic house as original as possible. If it is completely redone with new windows and siding it may look like an old house but it will not be. Mr. Angileri indicated that he wants to make the house as energy efficient as possible; however Chairman Henke did not think that necessitates completely stripping it.

Mr. Charles said he doesn't see the efficiency gain if the glass remains the same. Mr. Finnicum answered the old windows don't have integral flashing as the replicated windows would.

Mr. Willoughby was surprised the proposed replacement siding is so thin. He would like the sash to match. The board is not even sure that what is on the home is original.

Mr. Charles recalled that in his renovation of a home they were able to salvage the siding. He knew that it could be saved from one elevation on this house. The lead based paint can be safely removed using lead removal guidelines.

Mr. Angileri noted the best case is that 30% of the siding is bad. Chairman Henke observed tonight is the first time the board has seen any of this. Seventy percent of the siding is probably okay. He asked to be shown that they actually have a deteriorated situation and that the boards need to be replaced. The more narrow of the two lap sidings that are installed is probably the one that is consistent with this house. The original windows can be redone and put back in.

Mr. Willoughby noticed that none of the board had an objection to pulling the old siding off in order to put on Tyvek. The percentage of deteriorated boards will be clearer when the boards are off. Then an intelligent decision can be made whether to put them back on or replace them.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Chairman Henke that the board approves of the project as submitted for 607 Bates, the Major Jones House, with the exception that the applicant will repaint/repair the windows, remove the siding in order to install Tyvek, and at that time make an assessment of the siding that was removed and give us a count if more than 50% is removed. Administrative approval can be issued if that is the case.

Amended by Chairman Henke

Seconded by Mr. Charles and agreed to by the makers of the motion that a drawing is needed with respect to the foam and how that changes the exterior. Further, removal of the siding should be monitored to ensure that it is done carefully.

There were no comments from members of the public at 8:15 p.m.

Motion and amendment carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Henke, Charles, Filthaut, Fuller

Nays: None

Absent: Burle, Dukas, Trapnell

05-14-18

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

487 Willits

Edgar Lamb House

Mr. Baka highlighted the proposed work:

History: This house was commissioned to local builder Mr. Logan by Martha Baldwin in 1898. The house was to be built for Mr. Edgar Lamb who was the janitor at the high school in Birmingham. Several modifications have been made over the years. In the 1930's Scott Hersey remodeled the interior by adding a fireplace and removing interior partition walls. In the 1950's the small windows on either side of the fireplace were replaced with bay windows. This property was renowned in the 70's for its gardens, which were maintained by Mrs. Veinott, also known as Grandma Roses.

Proposed changes: The current proposal to renovate the exterior of the home will remove several changes that were made to the original structure. These changes include the following;

- Remove the previously installed aluminum siding and replace with new cedar wood lap board siding;
- Paint the body of the house BM "Storm Gray" and the trim BM "White Dove;"
- Replace several existing single pane bay windows with double hung windows;
- Remove the existing greenhouse on the rear of the building and rebuild with a pitched roof and sliding doors;
- Replace garage door;
- Replace railing and windows above garage doors;
- Convert the flat roof on the garage to a pitched roof; and
- Demolish the trellis on the back deck.

The following details the changes on each elevation:

North (front) elevation

The elevation of the house facing Willits is proposed to have two new double-hung Anderson windows to replace the existing aluminum windows. As with the rest of the home this elevation is also proposed to replace the existing aluminum siding with beveled lapboard siding on the first floor and cedar shake siding on the second floor.

West elevation

The applicant is proposing to replace the two large single-pane bay windows with two sets of side-by-side double-hung windows in each location. The garage door is proposed to be replaced with a new garage door. Above the garage door the applicant is proposing to replace the existing windows and metal railing with a 10 ft. sliding door, and new windows. The metal railing is proposed to be replaced with a new wooden railing. As with the rest of the home this elevation is also proposed to replace the existing aluminum siding with beveled lapboard siding on the first floor and cedar shake siding on the second floor.

South (rear) elevation

The applicant is proposing to replace the existing door wall with fixed windows. The greenhouse is proposed to be removed and replaced with a door wall and pitched roof. As with the rest of the home this elevation is also proposed to replace the existing aluminum siding with beveled lapboard siding on the first floor and cedar shake siding on the second floor.

East elevation

The applicant is proposing to replace one double-hung window and install two more in the reconstructed greenhouse room. As with the rest of the home this elevation is also proposed to replace the existing aluminum siding with beveled lapboard siding on the first floor and cedar shake siding on the second floor.

Mr. Tom Holleman, the architect, was present with Mr. Eric Vogle, the builder. Mr. Holleman indicated their goal is to replace all of the non-conforming changes that have been made to the home over the last 50 years.

Chairman Henke noted this house is being put together the way it is supposed to be; however, he struggles with replacing the flat roof on the garage with a pitched roof. Mr. Vogle noted the shakes will be cedar, hard nailed.

Motion by Mr. Charles

Seconded by Ms. Fuller to approve Historic Design Review for 487 Willits, Edgar Lamb House as proposed.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Charles, Fuller, Filthaut, Henke, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Burle, Dukas, Trapnell

05-15-18

STUDY SESSION

Overlay Signage Standards (not discussed)

05-16-18

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

A. Staff Reports

-- Administrative Approvals

- 137 W. Maple Rd., Drybar –
 - Installation of one set of illuminated letters;
 - Installation of one illuminated blade sign;
 - Installation of vinyl graphics on storefront windows.
- 268 W. Maple Rd., St. Croix – Installation of wall sign and double-sided blade sign.
- 217 S. Old Woodward Ave. – Remove and replace signage on west-facing wall with dimensional letters and logos per specification.
- 135 S. Old Woodward Ave., Verizon – New business sign for new business, west elevation, front façade.

B. Communications

-- Commissioners' Comments (none)

05-17-18

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the Chairman motioned to adjourn the meeting at 8:34 p.m.

Matthew Baka
Sr. Planner