

**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF JULY 16, 2014**
Municipal Building Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, July 16, 2014. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7:08 p.m.

Present: Chairman John Henke; Commission Members Mark Coir, Natalia Dukas, Vice-Chairperson Shelli Weisberg, Michael Willoughby; Student Representative Mitch Boorstein

Absent: Commission Members Keith Deyer, Darlene Gehringer; Student Representative Cambrea Rush

Administration: Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

Motion by Ms. Weisberg

Seconded by Ms. Dukas to hear the Design Review Board agenda prior to this meeting since there is only one item for the DRB to consider.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Dukas, Coir, Henke, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Gehringer, Deyer

The HDC adjourned temporarily at 7:10 p.m.

Chairman Henke reconvened the meeting at 7:12 p.m.

07-24-14

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

HDC Minutes of June 18, 2014

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Dukas to approve the HDC Minutes of June 18, 2014 as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Dukas, Coir, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Gehringer

Chairman Henke offered petitioners the opportunity to postpone to the next meeting at no additional cost when a full board might be present. It requires four affirmative votes to pass a motion and only five of the normal seven board members are present this evening. However, everyone wished to go forward.

07-25-14

HISTORIC SIGN REVIEW WITHOUT PRESENTATION

176 S. Old Woodward Ave.

Einstein Bagels

CBD Historic District

Zoning: B-4 Business Residential

Proposal: The applicant proposes to replace the existing name letter sign with the new corporate signage. The applicant also proposes to remove the existing projecting wall sign.

Illumination: The applicant proposes to halo light the sign with white LED's. in accordance with the provision of Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance that states name letter signs in the Historic District may only have halo type backlighting or architecturally compatible exterior light fixtures.

Motion by Mr. Coir

Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to approve the sign for 176 S. Old Woodward Ave., Einstein Bagels, as submitted.

Mr. Bill Stoger with the sign company spoke to represent Einstein Bagels. He assured Mr. Willoughby that the letters will be level but the hash underneath shrinks down at the end.

No one from the audience joined the discussion.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Coir, Weisberg, Dukas, Henke, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Gehringer

07-26-14

HISTORIC DESIGN AND SIGN REVIEW

138 S. Old Woodward Ave.

Pogo

CBD Historic District

Zoning: B-4, Business-Residential

Proposal: The applicant proposes to install a new storefront window system, new awning, paint the building and add new signage. The building is a designated contributing resource in the Central Business District known as the D.U.R. Waiting Room. The applicant appeared at the June 18th, 2014 HDC meeting. At that time the board requested that the applicant provide alternative color schemes for the body of the building and the window frames. They have returned this evening with four options (different shades of grey).

Storefront Windows and Facade: The existing storefront is constructed of a half wall that extends approximately 3 ft. 6 in. above grade with lightly tinted windows above and a recessed entry door on the left side of the building. The applicant proposes to remove the half wall, windows and door and replace them with a new full height window and door system.

The existing front façade is proposed to be patched and repaired as needed and painted one of several alternatives now included in the plans on the main portion of the body and limestone color on the cornice and Birmingham Savings Bank logo (BM, Berber White 955). The revised plans present four options with varying shades of grey for the body of the building with stainless steel frames on the windows and doors. Color scheme 3A presents the option of black window and door frames.

Awning Design: The applicant proposes to install a straight shed awning over the windows and entry on the tenant space. The closed-end awning is proposed to be covered with Sunbrella canvas. The proposed awning will be mounted 9 ft. 3 in. above grade. The awning fabric color will be Slate (Sunbrella 4684). The Downtown Overlay District requires that awning be open-ended. Although this building was not constructed under the overlay standards, **the Board may wish to consider requiring open-ends as a condition of approval in order to maintain consistency with the rest of the district.**

Signage: The applicant proposes to install a name letter sign. The total linear building frontage is 34 ft. 3 in. permitting 34.25 sq. ft. of sign area. The proposed name letter sign will measure 12 sq. ft. in accordance with Article 1.0, section 1.04 (B) of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance, Combined Sign Area that allows for all buildings, including multi-tenant office or retail buildings, the combined area of all types of signs shall not exceed 1 sq. ft. (1.5 sq. ft. for addresses on Woodward Ave.) for each linear foot of principal building frontage.

The wall sign is proposed to be mounted 15 ft. 7 in. above grade which meets the requirement of Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance that states wall signs projecting more than 3 in. from the building facade shall not be attached to the outer wall at a height of less than 8 ft. above a public sidewalk.

The proposed sign will be constructed of brushed aluminum channel letters. Letters reading "Pogo." will be 5 in. thick and 1 ft. 4 in. in height (not including descending G). The proposed sign will be mounted to the building with 1 ½ in. stand-offs.

Illumination: The existing surface mounted electrical and lighting will be removed and the façade patched and repaired as needed. The proposed sign will be illuminated with white LED backlighting.

Mr. Howard Davis, and Ms. Mandy Parker of Davis and Davis; Mr. Joe Patton, Mr. Allan's, were present for the petitioner. Ms. Parker indicated everything is the same as last time with the exception of the awning color, window frame color, and the paint color. She passed around real colors of their options for the board members to consider. The third option was her preference because it lightens the paint color, darkens the awning and provides a contrast.

Motion by Ms. Weisberg

Seconded by Mr. Willoughby to approve Option 3B which consists of Benjamin Moore CSP100; Sunbrella Black; Benjamin Moore 1616, Sorrel Sky; and clear anodized aluminum for the Pogo sign and window glazing.

There were no comments from the public at 7:25 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Willoughby, Coir, Dukas, Henke

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Gehringer

07-26-14

Motion by Ms. Dukas

Seconded by Mr. Coir to switch the order of the agenda so that the board hears the Historic Major Jones House first.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Dukas, Coir, Henke, Weisberg, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Gehringer

07-27-14

FINAL HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

607 Bates

Historic Major Jones House

Bates St. Historic District

Zoning: R-3 Single-Family

Proposal: This application received preliminary review and approval at the February 19, 2014 HDC meeting. The Historic Major Jones House is located on the north half of a large lot at 607 S. Bates. The south half of the lot is vacant. A Lot Split Application for the property was reviewed and approved by the City Commission at their March 10, 2014 meeting. The applicant returned to the HDC on May 7, 2014 to seek final approval for the renovation of the historic house. At that time, the HDC postponed the review to allow the applicant time to provide further details.

The applicant has now provided a material board that indicates the proposed materials and colors for the house, trim, window frames, shingles, metal roof, brick color and step and porch material. The applicant has also provided information on the companies that will be used to repair the windows and move the home, respectively.

Design: The applicant proposes to remove the existing stone foundation and construct a new concrete foundation. All exposed exterior faces of the new concrete foundation are proposed to be clad in the salvaged stone from the original foundation. The existing house will then be placed on the new foundation.

The applicant proposes to take several steps to preserve the historic house.

- The historic windows will be taken off-site for reconstruction to make them more energy efficient while retaining the existing wood frames and the decorative features including the stained glass and the carved wood head trim;
- The interior of the house has been gutted. The applicant proposes to stabilize the structure laterally and rebuild the interior of the house;
- The applicant proposes to add insulation to the house as needed;
- The applicant proposes lead paint mitigation as needed. Wood siding and trim will be repaired and/or replaced as needed. The exterior colors will be painted in "Queen Anne" paint colors as detailed on the material board. The main body of the house is proposed in pale yellow. The trim details are proposed to be a combination of cream, red and blue colors.

- The applicant proposes to replace the roof with new “Almost Black” asphalt shingles to match the existing shingles;
- The masonry chimney will be repaired as required; and
- The applicant proposes to install new zinc gutters, downspouts and flashing on the existing house.

West (front) Elevation

The applicant proposes to retain the entire facade of the historic house on the west elevation. The existing enclosed front porch will be removed and reconstructed to the original open porch design, based on historic photographs.

South (side) Elevation

The applicant proposes to demolish the lean-to addition and replace it with the reconstructed open front porch to match historic photos. At the rear of the original house, the applicant proposes to replace the existing one-story rear addition with a two-story addition. The proposed addition will have a slight step down at the roof-line which will join the original house and a double hung window will be added below the front facing section of gable roof. The siding will be made from Hardi-plank with a 6 in. exposure, which will be a slightly wider dimension than the original lap-siding. The east end of the proposed new addition will also have a side-facing gable with two small second-story windows, and a first story bay with a row of three double-hung windows. All of the new windows are proposed to be white aluminum clad wood windows. A zinc roof and sun shade is proposed to be installed above the window bay on the south and east elevation. New zinc gutters, downspouts and flashing is proposed to be installed on the new addition. **Based on the plans as submitted, it appears that the bay window at the rear of the south elevation extends into the side yard setback further than permitted by the Ordinance.** The Zoning Ordinance allows bay windows to project 2 in. into the required open space per 1 ft. of required space. In this case 5 ft. is required; therefore a 10 in. projection is permitted. The plans as submitted indicate a 20 in. projection. **The applicant has advised that they will revise the plans to meet the Zoning Ordinance.**

East (rear) Elevation

The applicant proposes to renovate the existing one-story rear addition into a two-story addition, making the house approximately 30% larger than it currently is. The proposed rear addition will have a side facing roof. The second-story will have a set of three windows on the south end, and a set of two windows on the north end. The south end of the first-story will have two wide steps leading up to French doors flanked by narrow windows. A small projecting roof will extend over the French doors and side windows, which will be clad in zinc. All of the proposed windows will be white double-hung aluminum clad wood windows.

North (side) Elevation

The north elevation of the two story addition will have a jumbo size brick chimney with a zinc clad top, rising from the ground up through the center of the side

facing gable. The applicant proposes removing the existing side door and porch, and replacing it with new side door that will be added between the original building and the new addition. The proposed side door will have a set of three stairs leading to the new door.

Illumination

No details on any proposed lighting were provided.

Mr. Jeff Dawkins, the architect, was present. He noted the addition is now no wider than the existing house per the board's request.

The chairman recalled the only thing that has been approved up to this point is the lot split. He noticed from last time to this time there has been movement on the north elevation of a door and a window. Also, he could not find the proposed new build north lot line elevation. Those concerns were resolved. Mr. Baka said the bay window extends too far into the south side yard, as noted in the report.

Mr. Dawkins advised he did not replicate the front porch roof because he didn't find it to be appropriate to Queen Anne architecture. The roof looks to him as though it was added to the house at a later date. The board's consensus was that he should restore the house as it shows in the picture on file with the Planning Dept. and make the addition different.

Chairman Henke took comments from the public at 7:50 p.m.

Dr. Golden said his family owns 563 S. Bates. He received confirmation that the Michigan basement will be replaced with a full basement and the setbacks will be maintained when the house is moved. Mr. Dawkins established the side of the house will be 12 ft. 9 in. from the lot line, because he was trying to hold it as far south and leave as much distance between houses as he could. The addition is narrower than previously shown. The house will be 2,400.65 sq. ft.

Ms. Dianna Golden, 563 S. Bates, asked about the width of the garage and Mr. Dawkins confirmed it is 20 ft. across. The 1950's garage is not historical. It should be complimentary, but not match.

Ms. Rose Devison, 580 S. Bates, was informed by Mr. Dawkins that he chose the pale yellow color from a historic Victorian color palette. Further, Ms. Devison was assured that the original windows and doors will be properly removed and restored. Mr. Dawkins announced his intention to document everything in order to make sure it is done correctly.

The chairman told the petitioner a new drawing for the front porch will be needed. The drawing shall correct the south side lot line setbacks.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to approve the Final Historic Design Review for 607 Bates, Historic Major Jones House, as submitted save for restoring the porch per the original photograph that is on file with the City. In terms of the original, as opposed to existing, windows and doors as best that can be determined are to be salvaged as much as possible. Also, both the porch and windows and doors shall be administratively approved.

Mr. Dawkins advised he will use Wood Window Repairs in Ann Arbor who will store the windows until there is a solid building.

Comments from the public on that motion were taken at 8:05 p.m.

Ms. Margie Skender, 612 S. Bates, voiced concerns about the moving and insuring of the house. Mr. Dawkins assured her they do not intend on removing the boards in order to move the house. Chairman Henke added that a Building Permit will not be issued unless the architect complies with the requirements of both this board and the Building Dept.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Weisberg, Coir, Dukas, Henke

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Gehringer

07-27-14

PRELIMINARY HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

631 Bates

Infill house (postponed from May 7, 2014)

Bates St. Historic District

Zoning: R-3, Single Family

Proposal: This application was discussed regarding its feasibility at the February 19, 2014 HDC meeting. The Historic Major Jones House is located on the north half of a large lot at 607 S. Bates. The south half of the lot is vacant. A Lot Split Application for the property was reviewed and approved by the City Commission at their March 10, 2014 meeting. The 631 S. Bates address is tentative, and has not yet been approved by the City. The applicant appeared before the HDC to seek preliminary approval for the design of the new infill house on May 7th, 2014 and the application was postponed. The new plans have been revised since that time to reduce the amount of brick on the structure to just the foundation and chimney. The body of the house is now comprised completely of siding. Also, additional supplemental information on the massing of the new

house has been provided on a sheet that places the new home in context with other homes on the street.

Proposal: The applicant proposes to construct an infill house in the vacant lot next to 607 S. Bates. The proposed house is reminiscent of a traditional farmhouse but it will use contemporary materials.

The applicant detailed the following points regarding the new house:

A 'farmhouse' will be an appropriate addition to Bates Street (Historic District). The simplicity of the proposed house with its use of gables and simple shapes, use of a combination of brick (foundation and chimney) and lap siding and modest color scheme will blend with its neighbors.

The houses in the Bates Street Historic District vary in size; the proposed house will be in scale with the smaller houses – an eave height of 20 ft. and overall height of 25 ft. 4 in. (as measured to the midpoint of the roof – just over 30 ft. as measured to the peak of the ridge) and a footprint of 1,142 sq. ft. The house will be 'street friendly' including a front porch.

- The first floor will have nine foot ceilings;
- The proposed home is in the style of a farmhouse; similar to homes in the area.
- The house will include a covered front porch.

Exterior:

- Brick (foundation and chimney) and lap siding;
- Combination of asphalt and metal roof;
- The trim will be simple flat stock;
- The windows will have appropriate muntins;
- Detached, single story garage (no habitable attic) at the rear of the yard.

Mr. Dawkins said he thinks a clad wood house with a brick foundation and chimney is most appropriate for the street. Right now the house is 2,283.10 sq. ft. which is 117 sq. ft. less than the historic house. He is asking for a habitable attic that will be 8 ft. high down the center, which will be an issue for the Building Dept. to oversee. All agreed this submission is a big improvement from last time.

Comments from the public were heard at 8:20 p.m.

Dr. Golden was assured the foundation and chimney will be true brick and not brick veneer. The house will have a full basement.

Ms. Margie Skender received clarification the lot is needed in order to move the historic house. The City approves the plans and inspectors come out on a regular basis to ensure the plans are followed.

In response to his request, Mr. Baka told Mr. Dawkins it is possible to be on the next HDC agenda for Final Site Plan Review.

Mr. Baka summarized a letter received from the neighbor at 651 Bates. He had questions about the setbacks, the purpose of the terrace, and he feels that the two houses are too close to the street. It was noted that is dictated by Ordinance.

**Motion by Mr. Willoughby
Seconded by Ms. Dukas to approve the Preliminary Historic Design Review for 631 Bates infill house as submitted. The applicant will submit his application to the Planning Dept. to appear on the next HDC agenda for Final Historic Design Review.**

At 8:26 p.m. there were no comments from the public on the motion.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Dukas, Coir, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Gehringer

07-28-14

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

A. Staff Reports

-- Administrative Approvals

➤ 220 Merrill St.. - Mechanical and trash screening at rear of building.

-- Violation Notices (none)

-- Demolition Applications

- 1387 Webster
- 1291 Humphrey
- 1221 Hillside
- 1258 Ruffner
- 409 E. Southlawn
- 2042 Dorchester

B. Communications

-- Commissioners' Comments (none)

07-29-14

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the board motioned to adjourn the meeting at 8:30 p.m.

Matthew Baka
Sr. Planner