

**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF JUNE 18, 2014**
Municipal Building Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, June 18, 2013. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7:03 p.m.

Present: Chairman John Henke; Commission Members Mark Coir, Natalia Dukas, Darlene Gehringer, Vice-Chairperson Shelli Weisberg; Student Representative Mitch Boorstein,

Absent: Keith Deyer, Michael Willoughby; Student Representative Cambrea Rush

Administration: Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

Chairman Henke offered petitioners the opportunity to postpone to the next meeting with no additional cost when a full board might be present, as it requires four affirmative votes to pass a motion. However, everyone wished to go forward this evening.

06-17-14

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES
HDC Minutes of May 7, 2014**

Motion by Mr. Coir

Seconded by Ms. Dukas to approve the HDC Minutes of May 7, 2014 as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Coir, Dukas, Gehringer, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

06-18-14

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW
220 E. Merrill
Historic Detroit Edison Co.**

CBD Historic District

Motion by Ms. Weisberg

Seconded by Mr. Coir to pass for now, as the appellant was not present.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Coir, Dukas, Gehringer, Henke

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

Zoning: B-4 Business-Residential

Proposal: The applicant proposes to update the outdoor dining area of a one-story, single-tenant contributing historic building in the CBD Historic District. The building was originally constructed in 1931 and designed in the English Revival style to compliment Birmingham's City Hall and the Baldwin Library. The building was sold in 1978 for use as a restaurant and office. It was recently purchased by a new owner and is undergoing an interior renovation. The applicant proposes to increase the outdoor dining area, add a pergola, and replace a window with a door.

This application was reviewed at the May 7, 2014 HDC meeting, and the changes to the building were approved. The HDC requested that the applicant return with clarification on several items. Additionally, the applicant made some changes to the proposal regarding adding pavers to the front of the building.

Outdoor Dining Area: The applicant proposes to expand the existing 360 sq. ft. outdoor dining area the full length of the property. The applicant is also proposing to include a new outdoor dining area west to the bollards that delineate the Active Via. The existing outdoor dining area will also extend into the public sidewalk to the north. The total outdoor dining area proposed is 825 sq. ft. The applicant is proposing a total of 70 seats in the expanded outdoor dining area. Four flush in-ground mounted patio umbrellas in Sunbrella "Canvas Parrot" are proposed at the eastern and western ends of the expanded outdoor dining area.

Pergola: The applicant proposes to install a pergola structure in front of the storefront windows of the original dining area. The pergola will extend over approximately 300 sq. ft. of the outdoor dining area. The proposed pergola will remain in place during the winter season when the outdoor dining area is not in use.

The Planning Division is of the opinion that the proposed pergola has the more delicate decorative styling that is associated with French

architecture, and is not quite compatible with the strong bold lines associated with the historic English Tudor styling of the building.

Landscaping: The majority of the proposed outdoor dining area is located on private property. The existing concrete planters that surround the current outdoor dining on the site will remain, and new ones will be manufactured to match for a total of 11 planters surrounding the expanded outdoor dining area. For the winter season, the applicant proposes to remove and store the planters.

Pavers: The applicant proposes to install Unilock Select, Umbriano pavers in the color Summer Wheat. The creamy white pavers will be bordered by Unilock Serlect, Belpasso pavers in the color Nuvola (medium grey). The proposed pavers will be located on the front and west side of the building.

The Planning Division has determined that the proposed two-tone pavers are not appropriate for this historic building. The pattern is busy and adds another color, not found in the building.

Illumination: The existing pedestrian light fixtures on E. Merrill in the right-of-way will remain. The applicant is proposing to remove the two existing ground mounted light fixtures that flank either side of the existing entrance to the restaurant. No new building lighting is proposed and no lighting is proposed for the pergola.

Ms. Denise Ilich and Mr. Zaid Elia, the business partners, were present.

Chairs

Chairman Henke noted they will need a tear sheet for the chairs.

Mr. Elia said they have ordered the chair cushions in mineral blue but they would like to have the option to leave them off.

Pavers

Chairman Henke voiced his personal opinion that he would like to see one paver color as opposed to two. Mr. Elia indicated they don't want to use concrete because of the cracking. He explained how the two paver colors that are proposed fit in with their overall concept of the restaurant. The consensus of board members was to approve the pavers as presented.

Planters

Mr. Coir felt the planters overlap the 5 ft. clear walkway in two sections. Mr. Baka added that ADA compliant tree grates are used as part of the 5 ft. easement. Mr. Christopher Longe, Architect, explained they have maintained 5 ft. in all areas. Additionally, the planters are movable. Mr. Elia agreed to remove the planters, tables, and chairs and store them for the winter.

Pergola

Mr. Elia advised the design of the pergola was to accentuate the beauty of the building and to create a charming environment that everyone will appreciate. The hanging baskets and plantings have been removed. Ms. Ilich added that two architects have suggested that a pergola would enhance the front of the building. It is a natural addition and it will add life to the street and attract more people to the community.

Mr. Coir had a problem with this particular design for the pergola. Something more germane would be somewhat more English, similar to what is found at Cranbrook House.

Ms. Weisberg appreciated Mr. Coir's view but was fine with the pergola as proposed and likes the thought of ivy growing on it. She gives the applicant the benefit of the doubt that they will maintain it correctly. She would be afraid of a wood pergola.

Ms. Dukas also respected Mr. Coir's opinion. Additionally she was worried about maintenance of the plantings.

Ms. Gehringer was not sure whether a pergola is even necessary. If it is necessary, this particular design may be too simplistic.

Mr. Elia questioned what they can do to make their vision happen. Ms. Ilich proposed they erect the pergola for the summer; and if the commission members don't like it they will take it down. The applicants preferred to include plantings.

Motion by Ms. Dukas

Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to grant temporary approval for the pergola including plantings with the condition they come back on September 17 for review.

There were no comments from the public at 8:50 p.m.

Motion failed, 3-2.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Dukas, Weisberg, Henke

Nays: Coir, Gehringer

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

Mr. Elia thought they deserve the benefit of the doubt. The board has nothing to lose over the next two months. Ms. Ilich indicated they just want to prove the pergola can be beautiful. This is the type of differentiator that could make this community really interesting and draw in more traffic to the area. She pleaded with the commission to just give them a shot.

Motion by Ms. Dukas

Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to grant temporary approval for the pergola including plantings but no lights with the condition the petitioner reappear before the HDC on September 17 for either approval or denial of the pergola remaining in place or being removed from the site.

Motion carried, 4-1.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Dukas, Gehringer, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: Coir

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

Motion by Ms. Dukas

Seconded by Ms. Gehringer to approve the two-tone paving as submitted; to approve the planters with the understanding that the ADA compliance of a 5 ft. walkway will be maintained; that the board requires a correct tear sheet on the chairs; and that the planters will be removed completely from the outdoor area in the winter.

There were no comments from the public on that motion at 9 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Dukas, Gehringer, Coir, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

06-19-14

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

203 Pierce St.

Toast Birmingham

CBD Historic District

Zoning: B-4 Business Residential

Proposal: The applicant is seeking to add outdoor dining with a bump-out deck in the street. The applicant obtained a recommendation of approval from the Planning Board on May 14, 2014, on the Final Site Plan and Special Land Use Permit ("SLUP") Also, as required in the Zoning Ordinance, this request for a platform on the street was also reviewed by the Advisory Parking Committee on May 28, 2014, and was approved 6-0. The applicant will seek approval from the City Commission for the Final Site Plan, SLUP, and for the operation of a Bistro License on July 14, 2014.

The building is a non-contributing resource which is seeking a Bistro License. While the building is not designated, in accordance with Chapter 127, Section 127-11 (c) the Commission shall have the responsibility to review proposed projects on all properties within a designated Historic District (both historic and non-historic resources).

Outdoor Dining Area: The applicant proposes to add an on-street dining platform to the existing outdoor dining area. The applicant currently has tables located in the storefront space lining Pierce St. A total of fifty-two (52) aluminum bistro chairs are proposed for the outdoor dining space with twenty-eight (28) on an elevated platform along Pierce St., and twenty-four (24) on the sidewalk directly along the front elevation of the building. The black aluminum wicker chairs and bistro tables currently used in the sidewalk dining area will be replicated for the proposed platform.

The applicant is proposing to construct a temporary 11.16 ft. by 32 ft. platform of composite non-slip decking fastened with clips to provide a level outdoor dining surface on the sidewalk and into the street. The platform is proposed to extend into two parking spaces along Pierce St. The platform will have a 4 ft. wide access ramp to make it wheelchair accessible. The applicant is also proposing a 3 ft. high custom-made metal fencing system to enclose the outdoor dining space. This enclosure will be attached to the temporary platform and sub-frame.

Mr. Christopher Longe, Architect, was present to answer questions. He noted they will be coming back because of plans to re-do the front canopy and the storefront.

Motion by Ms. Weisberg

Seconded by Mr. Coir to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Historic Design Review at 203 Pierce St., Toast Birmingham. The work as proposed meets "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation" standard number 9.

There were no comments from the public at 7:11 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Coir, Dukas, Gehringer, Henke,

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

06-20-14

**HISTORIC DESIGN AND SIGN REVIEW
138 S. Old Woodward Ave.**

**Pogo
CBD Historic District**

Zoning: B-4 Business-Residential

Proposal: The applicant proposes to install a new storefront window system, new awning, paint the building, and add new signage. This is the former Olga's space. The building is a designated contributing resource in the Central Business District known as the D.U.R waiting room.

Storefront Windows and Facade: The existing storefront is constructed of a half wall that extends approximately 3 ft. 6 in. above grade with lightly tinted windows above and a recessed entry door on the left side of the building. The applicant proposes to remove the half wall, windows and door and replace it with a new full height window and door system. The windows are proposed to have new tempered glass bronze or black anodized window and door frames. The entryway is proposed to be recessed with a 36 in. wide glass door and 2 ft. 10 ½ in. sidelite.

The existing front façade is proposed to be patched and repaired as needed and painted Charcoal Grey (BM, Graphite 1603) on the main portion of the body and limestone color on the cornice and Birmingham Savings Bank logo (BM, Berber White 955).

Awning Design: The applicant proposes to install an awning over the windows and entry on the tenant space. The closed-end awning is proposed to be covered with Sunbrella canvas. The proposed awning will be mounted 9 ft. 3 in. above grade. The awning fabric color will be Slate (Sunbrella 4684).

Signage: The applicant proposes to install a name letter sign. The total linear building frontage is 34 ft. 3 in. permitting 34.25 sq. ft. of sign area. The proposed name letter sign will measure 12 sq. ft. which is in accordance with Article 1.0, section 1.04 (B) of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance, Combined Sign Area that states for all buildings, including multi-tenant office or retail buildings, the combined area of all types of signs shall not exceed 1 sq. ft. (1.5 sq. ft. for addresses on Woodward Ave.) for each linear foot of principal building frontage.

The wall sign is proposed to be mounted 15 ft. 7 in. above grade. in accordance with Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance - Wall signs that project more than 3 in. from the building facade shall not be attached to the outer wall at a height of less than 8 ft. above a public sidewalk. The proposal meets this requirement.

The proposed sign will be constructed of brushed aluminum channel letters. Letters reading "Pogo." will be 5 in. thick and 1 ft. 4 in. in height (not including descending G). The proposed sign will be mounted to the building with 1 ½ in. stand-offs.

Illumination: The existing surface mounted electrical and lighting will be removed and the façade patched and repaired as needed. The proposed sign will be illuminated with white LED backlighting.

Ms. Mandy Parker, the applicant, explained their first option was to replace the dryvit on the facade with brick veneer but they were told it would need to stay and just be painted.

Mr. Baka noted it was staff's decision that even though this was not the original building, it had dryvit when designated as a contributing resource. It was then discussed that maybe it would be possible for the applicant to strip off the dryvit and re-clad the area with brick (not brick veneer). Ms. Parker indicated they would stick with tonight's proposal.

Chairman Henke said the Planning Dept. will need glazing specs, color samples, and material samples.

Ms. Gehringer noted she is not in favor of painting the building black.

Motion by Ms. Weisberg

Seconded by Mr. Coir to approve the Historic Design and Sign Review for 138 S. Old Woodward Ave., Pogo, with the addition of the specs on the glazing and a sign sample.

The chairman called for comments from the public at 7:25 p.m.

Ms. Denise Elich said the design looks amazing.

Motion failed, 3-2.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Weisberg, Coir, Henke

Nays: Dukas, Gehringer

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

Ms. Dukas thought the building looks almost too monochromatic and it needs something to break it up. Ms. Gehringer said a dark color makes the building look very massive and dark.

Mr. Howard Davis, Davis and Davis, suggested a lighter shade of grey in view of their time to open.

Motion by Ms. Gehringer

Seconded by Ms. Weisberg to postpone the Historic Design and Sign Review for 138 S. Old Woodward Ave., Pogo.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Gehringer, Weisberg, Coir, Dukas, Henke

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

Ms. Gehringer moved to withdraw her motion for postponement and all were in favor.

Motion by Ms. Gehringer

Seconded by Ms. Dukas to approve part of the presentation for Pogo so they can advance with construction as soon as possible. The board approves the conceptual design, the removal of the half wall, and everything but the sign itself, the glazing colors and the color of the paint. Balance of design presentation and proposal and signage to be postponed.

Motion carried, 5-0.

There were no comments from members of the public at 7:50 p.m.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Gehringer, Dukas, Coir, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

06-21-14

HISTORIC SIGN REVIEW

108 S. Old Woodward Ave.

Eli Tea Bar

Historic O'Neal Bldg.

CBD Historic District

Zoning: B-4 Business Residential

Proposal: The applicant proposes to install one sign on the tenant space of a two-story, contributing historic building and designate an area for an additional future sign. The tenant space is the former Cold Stone Creamery location.

Signage: The applicant proposes to install a wall sign. The total linear building frontage is 20 ft. 4 in., permitting 20.25 sq. ft. of sign area. The proposed **front wall sign** will measure 13.5 sq. ft. The proposed **future wall sign** will measure 6.75 sq. ft. The total proposal area for signage on the building is 20.25 sq. ft. which is in accordance with Article 1.0, section 1.04 (B) of the Birmingham Sign

Ordinance, Combined Sign Area that allows for all buildings, including multi-tenant office or retail buildings, the combined area of all types of signs shall not exceed 1 sq. ft. (1.5 sq. ft. for addresses on Woodward Ave.) for each linear foot of principal building frontage.

The **wall sign** is proposed to be mounted 11 ft. 2 in. above grade which complies with Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance that states wall signs that project more than 3 in. from the building facade shall not be attached to the outer wall at a height of less than 8 ft. above a public sidewalk and at a height of less than 15 ft. above public driveways, alleys and thoroughfares.

The proposed **wall sign** black background and white letters will be constructed of acrylic plastic. White letters reading "Eli Tea Bar" will be 3/8 in. thick mounted on a 1 ft. 6 in. background. There are six (6) vertical stripes located in the center of the sign that range the spectrum of the rainbow.

Illumination: The applicant is proposing to up light the sign with three small 18w LED light fixtures. In addition, the proposal includes two additional up lights to be added in the future if a second sign is added.

Motion by Ms. Dukas

Seconded by Ms. Gehringer to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Historic Design Review at 108 S. Old Woodward Ave., Eli Tea Bar. The work as proposed meets "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation" standard number 9.

It was noted by Mr. Elias Majid, the applicant, that the building owner painted the building white without approval. Chairman Henke suggested the building owner be notified about the painting that wasn't approved.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Dukas, Gehringer, Coir, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: Deyer, Willoughby

06-22-14

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

A. Staff Reports

-- Administrative Approvals

➤ 261 E. Maple Rd. - New windows.

- 5395 Bates St. - Exterior paint color.
- Violation Notices (none)
- Demolition Applications
 - 1324 Webster
 - 1691 Shipman Blvd.
 - 1690 Birmingham Blvd.
 - 2300 Avon Ln.
 - 1425 Stanley
 - 1411 Humphrey Ave.
 - 1706 Stanley
 - 908 Oakland
 - 1630 Villa
 - 1088 Floyd
 - 924 Arlington
 - 383 Greenwood St.

B. Communications

- Commissioners' Comments

06-23-14

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the board motioned to adjourn the meeting at 9:12 p.m.

Matthew Baka
Sr. Planner