

**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF MAY 7, 2014**
Municipal Building Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission (“HDC”) held Wednesday, May 7, 2013. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7:03 p.m.

Present: Chairman John Henke; Commission Members Mark Coir, Keith Deyer, Natalia Dukas, Darlene Gehringer, Vice-Chairperson Shelli Weisberg (arrived from Lansing at 7:05 p.m.), Michael Willoughby; Student Representatives Mitch Boorstein, Cambrea Rush (left at 9:20 p.m.)

Administration: Sheila Bashiri, City Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

05-10-14

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES
HDC Minutes of February 19, 2014**

**Motion by Mr. Willoughby
Seconded by Ms. Dukas to approve the HDC Minutes of February 19, 2014
as presented.**

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Dukas, Coir, Deyer, Gehringer, Henke

Nays: None

Absent: Weisberg

Chairman Henke offered petitioners the opportunity to postpone to the next meeting when a full board might be present, but everyone wished to go forward this evening.

05-11-14

**HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW
220 E. Merrill
Historic Detroit Edison Co.
CBD Historic District**

Zoning: B-4 Business-Residential

Proposal: The applicant proposes to update the outdoor dining area of a one-story, single-tenant contributing historic building in the CBD Historic District. The building was originally constructed in 1931 and designed in the English Revival style to compliment Birmingham's City Hall and the Baldwin Library. It was sold in 1978 for use as a restaurant and office, and recently purchased by a new owner. The applicant is proposing to increase the outdoor dining area, add a pergola, and replace a window with a door.

The applicant is required to obtain a Special Land Use Permit ("SLUP") due to the change in ownership of both the restaurant and the liquor license. The applicant has already obtained a recommendation from the Planning Board, and approval from the City Commission for the Final Site Plan and SLUP.

Outdoor Dining Area: The applicant proposes to expand the existing 360 sq. ft. outdoor dining area the full length of the property. The applicant is also proposing to include a new outdoor dining area west to the bollards that delineate the Active Via. The existing outdoor dining area will also extend into the public sidewalk to the north. The total outdoor dining area proposed is 825 sq. ft. The applicant is proposing a total of 70 seats in the expanded outdoor dining area. Four flush in-ground mounted patio umbrellas in Sunbrella "Canvas Parrot" are proposed at the eastern and western ends of the expanded outdoor dining area.

Pergola: The applicant proposes to install a pergola structure in front of the storefront windows of the original dining area. Overhead planters and lights are proposed for the central portion of the outdoor dining area. The required 5 ft. pedestrian pathway will be maintained along the entire frontage of the building.

Landscaping: The applicant is proposing to add ADA compliant tree grates to two existing street tree wells. The existing concrete planters that surround the current outdoor dining will remain and new ones will be manufactured to match for a total of 11 planters surrounding the expanded outdoor dining area. Hanging planters are also proposed along the top of the proposed pergola.

Illumination: The existing pedestrian light fixtures on E. Merrill in the right-of-way will remain. The applicant is proposing to remove the two existing ground mounted light fixtures that flank either side of the existing entrance to the restaurant. The applicant is proposing to mount hanging light fixtures in three rows overhead on the proposed pergola. The proposed lights are Denali floodlights, manufactured by B-K Lighting.

Mr. Chris Longe, Architect, explained they are seeking to expand the outdoor dining for this building to the east and to the west. The vestibule doesn't meet ADA requirements so they are proposing to install doors that meet those requirements and that also facilitate people moving in and out of the outdoor cafe

area. The pergola frames the center section of the building. The idea of the pergola is a trellis that allows plantings to grow up and over it. Planter baskets will hang on the outside of the pergola. Pots with greenery will define the seating area to the east and west and during the Winter they will be pulled back off of the right-of-way.

Mr. Deyer liked everything except he did not think the pergola matches the historic building. Mr. Willoughby received confirmation that all of the chairs will match and the marble tables will be the same, except for size. He thought it is good that the pergola doesn't look historic and it will be a nice feature of the facade. Other board members wished to see more detail on the pergola and the type of plantings that are proposed. Ms. Gehringer wanted a rendering that depicts the pergola in summer and in winter.

Ms. Denise Elitch, business partner, showed a sample of their proposed classic white chair. Mr. Zaid Elia, her partner, established that part of their design was developed after feedback from residents. They wanted something intimate and inviting that respects the nature of the historic building. They are working with the community development director on the design for replacement of the concrete.

Mr. Deyer suggested that the board take a vote on the whole plan and defer the pergola so that Mr. Longe can come back with some cut sheets.

Motion by Mr. Deyer

Seconded by Mr. Willoughby that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 220 Merrill. The work meets "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation" with the exception of the pergola and the terrace area around it. He would like to see the following items brought back for the board's review with the additional detail that was discussed, as follows:

- **Intended plantings on the pergola;**
- **Lighting spec sheets;**
- **Tear sheet for the chair;**
- **Floor plan for winter and summer placement of the planters; and**
- **Pergola detail winter and summer.**

There were no comments or questions from the public at 7:50 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Deyer, Willoughby, Coir, Dukas, Gehringer, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

5-12-14

FINAL HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

607 S. Bates

Historic Major Jones House

Bates St. Historic District

Zoning: R-3 Single-Family

Proposal: This application received preliminary review and approval at the February 19, 2014 HDC meeting. The Historic Major Jones House is located on the north half of a large lot at 607 S. Bates. The south half of the lot is vacant. A Lot Split Application for the property was reviewed and approved by the City Commission at their March 10, 2014 meeting. The applicant has returned to the HDC to seek final approval for the renovation of the historic house and also to construct a new house.

Design: The applicant proposes to temporarily stabilize and remove the house from the existing foundation. The existing stone foundation will be removed, and a new concrete foundation will be constructed. All exposed exterior faces of the new concrete foundation are proposed to be clad in the salvaged stone from the original foundation. The existing house will then be placed on the new foundation.

The applicant proposes to take several steps to preserve the historic house.

- The applicant is seeking historic preservation window experts to remove the windows and take them off-site for reconstruction to make them more energy efficient while retaining the existing wood frames. The decorative features including the stained glass and the carved wood head trim will remain;
- The interior of the house has been gutted. The applicant proposes to stabilize the structure laterally and rebuild the interior of the house;
- The applicant proposes to add insulation to the house as needed;
- The applicant proposes lead paint mitigation as needed. Wood siding and trim will be repaired and/or replaced as needed. The exterior colors will be painted in "Queen Anne" paint colors;
- The applicant proposes to replace the roof with new Almost Black asphalt shingles to match the existing shingles;
- The masonry chimney will be repaired as required; and
- The applicant intends to install new zinc gutters, downspouts and flashing.

West (front) Elevation

The applicant proposes to retain the historic house on the west elevation. The existing enclosed front porch will be removed and reconstructed to the original open porch design.

South (side) Elevation

The applicant proposes to demolish the southwest elevation lean-to addition and replace it with the reconstructed front porch. At the rear of the original house, the applicant proposes to replace the existing one-story addition with a two-story addition. A zinc roof and sun shade is proposed to be installed above the window bay on the south and east elevation. New zinc gutters, downspouts and flashing are proposed on the new addition.

East (rear) Elevation

The applicant proposes to renovate the existing one-story rear addition into a two-story addition, making the house approximately 30% larger than it currently is.

North (side) Elevation

The north elevation of the two-story addition will have a jumbo-size brick chimney with a zinc clad top rising from the ground through the center of the side-facing gable. The applicant proposes removing the existing side and porch and replacing it.

Site Changes

The applicant proposes to install a 3 ft. high wrought iron fence from the south side front porch, across the front of the property near the sidewalk, and up the north side of the property ending near the front of the house. Other site changes include removal and relocation of the existing driveway and new landscaping for the site.

Illumination: The applicant will present the lighting proposal at a future HDC meeting.

Mr. Jeff Dawkins, Architect, said his client bought the property and wants to find a way to restore the house and add modern amenities. The costs are quite high so the idea was to get a lot split to make the restoration economically viable. As long as the house needs a new foundation, he proposes to move it north about five feet and clad the exposed portions of the concrete foundation with original stones from the basement. He would like to restore the parlor in the front, retain the covered porch and return the front door to where it was. Further, he proposes to re-do the additions. The house is amazingly in tact. He would like to place a low iron fence about 3 ft. from the sidewalk with hydrangea along the sidewalk and then very simple landscaping.

The body of the house is proposed in pale yellow and the addition in yellow-green. He has not found discussion from the Secretary of the Interior as to allowable size of an addition to a historic structure. He indicated they will not be asking for variances. Before they move the house the windows will be removed and taken off-site to be restored. Discussion followed as to where the original historic home stops. Mr. Dawkins proposed going up one floor on top of the one-story rear part of the house. Chairman Henke said the following information will be needed as part of the proposal:

- Who will restore the doors and windows;
- An engineering report as to how the house will be moved 5 ft.;
- Spec sheets on the paint colors;
- Porch and step materials need to be specified;
- Pitch and material of the roof;
- Foundation material.

Mr. Deyer noticed the addition comes out from the original house. Perceived massing from the street view would be reduced if it stayed in line with the original house. Mr. Willoughby pointed out that the size, material and color have been changed on the addition. To him, that was one step too much. Therefore, Mr. Dawkins agreed to keep the yellow color with white trim.

Mr. Bill Taubman, 651 Bates, expressed his concern with the idea of a lot split on what was a narrow lot. He had a problem with moving the house to accommodate a second house in order to make a profit.

Mr. Bob Murdock, owner of the house to the north, was worried about the massive house that would be moved almost up against his windows.

Mr. Dawkins passed around pictures of his proposed two car garages. Colors will match the houses and they will be 18.5 ft. in height. Mr. Willoughby thought they would look better a couple of feet taller.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Mr. Coir to change the agenda and go to 215 W. Maple Rd., West Elm, and then back to the infill house.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Coir, Deyer, Dukas, Gehringer, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

05-13-14

HISTORIC DESIGN AND SIGN REVIEW

215 W. Maple Rd.
West Elm
CBD Historic District

Zoning: B-4 Business-Residential

Proposal: The applicant proposes to renovate a non-contributing 1 1/2 story multi-tenant building. The building is the current location of Roots, and the former location of Lexi Drew. The applicant has leased the Lexi Drew tenant space and the vacant tenant space to the west. They will become the new West Elm showroom and the new West Elm break room. The applicant proposes to paint the building, install new windows and doors, install new awnings, install a new stair and railing, install a new loading ramp, install a new trash enclosure, and install new lighting and signage.

W. Maple Rd. (north) Elevation

The entire building is proposed to be painted Gunmetal (Sherwin Williams 1602). The applicant proposes to replace the existing W. Maple Rd. storefront windows with new storefront windows that have transoms to mimic the existing windows. The existing showroom doors will be replaced with new "West Elm" doors and "West Elm" door pulls by Oldcastle.

Additionally, the break room storefront windows and door will be removed and replaced with full height windows, manufactured by CC to match the new showroom windows.

Martin (south-rear) Elevation

The applicant proposes to renovate the rear elevation at Martin St. and create a new rear entrance and customer pick-up area. The building has two existing rear entrances on porches that are accessed by a small set of stairs. The existing door and the wall to the right are proposed to be removed and replaced with two new storefront windows. Centered between the two new storefront windows will be a new recessed sales room entrance.

The applicant proposes to remove the stairs and make a larger landing for the rear entrance. The existing porch and stair railing will be removed and a new railing will be installed in its place.

The two existing vinyl umbrella style **awnings** above the rear porches are proposed to be removed and replaced with two new angled awnings.

The applicant proposes to remove the existing masonry trash enclosure and replace it with a new brick enclosure with wood gates.

Signage: The applicant proposes to install two name letter signs. The total linear building frontage is 68.5 ft. permitting 68.5 sq. ft. of sign area. The

proposed **Maple Rd. elevation** name letter signs will measure 33 sq. ft. **Rear elevation** name letter signs will measure 27 sq. ft. The combined total of both name letter signs will be 60 sq. ft. The proposed **awning** signs will measure 1.4 sq. ft. The combined total of all signs will be 61.4 sq. ft., in accordance with Article 1.0, section 1.04 (B) of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance, Combined Sign Area that states for all buildings, including multi-tenant office or retail buildings, the combined area of all types of signs shall not exceed 1 sq. ft. for each linear foot of principal building frontage.

The name letter signs are proposed to be mounted over 12 ft. above grade, meeting the requirement of Article 1.0, Table B of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance that states wall signs projecting more than 3 in. from the building facade shall not be attached to the outer wall at a height of less than 8 ft. above a public sidewalk and at a height of less than 15 ft. above public driveways, alleys and thoroughfares.

The proposed channel letters will be constructed of aluminum with white faces and black returns. On the Maple Rd. elevation, letters reading "West Elm" will be 1 ½ in. thick and 2 ft. in height. On the rear elevation, letters reading "West Elm" will be 1 ½ in. thick and 22 in. in height. The proposed sign will be pin-mounted ½ in. off the building.

Awning Signage: Vinyl lettering is proposed to be 0.7 sq. ft., in accordance with the City of Birmingham's Historic District General Signage which allows 33% of the valance area for signage.

Parking Signage: The applicant proposes to install five parking signs for customers. The proposed signs will be constructed of aluminum panels on 2 in. dia. aluminum posts. The proposed signs will measure 1.5 sq. ft. each. In accordance with Article 1.0, Table C of the Birmingham Sign Ordinance - Parking District Signs may be up to 9 sq. ft. per side and do not count against the allowable combined total for signage. The proposal meets this requirement. The painted letters on the proposed signs will read "Reserved Parking for West Elm Customer Pick-up."

Illumination: The applicant proposes to illuminate the sign letters with 500ok white LED halo backlighting. The applicant proposes to illuminate the rear entrances with three cylinder wall mounted down lights. The proposed lights by FC Lighting will be located beneath the awnings. The fixtures will be 6 in. dia with 24w LED lamps.

Mr. Josh Klein from Callison Architecture indicated they will use the existing dumpster enclosure and paint it to match the building. Also, the fence will be painted to match the building.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Gehringer to approve the Historic Design and Sign Review for 215 W. Maple Rd., West Elm, as submitted.

There were no comments from the public on the motion at 9:12 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Gehringer, Coir, Deyer, Dukas, Henke, Weisberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion by Ms. Gehringer

Seconded by Mr. Coir to close the HDC meeting temporarily and open the DRB meeting.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Gehringer, Coir, Deyer, Dukas, Henke, Weisberg, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: None

Chairman Henke reconvened the HDC meeting at 9:35 p.m.

05-14-14

PRELIMINARY HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW

631 S. Bates (tentative)

New Infill house

Bates St. Historic District

Zoning: R-3 Single-Family

Proposal: The application was discussed regarding its feasibility at the February 19, 2014 HDC meeting. A Lot Split Application for the property was approved by the City Commission at their March 10, 2014 meeting. The applicant has returned to the HDC to seek preliminary approval for the design of the new infill house.

The applicant proposes to construct an infill house in the vacant lot next to 607 S. Bates. The proposed house is reminiscent of a traditional farmhouse but it will use contemporary materials.

The applicant detailed the following points regarding the new house:

- A 'farmhouse' will be an appropriate addition to Bates St. (Historic District).

- The simplicity of the proposed house with its use of gables and simple shapes, use of a combination of brick and lap siding and soft color scheme will blend with its neighbors.
- The houses in the Bates Street Historic District vary in size; the proposed house will be in scale with the smaller houses – an eave height of 20 ft. and overall height of 25 ft. 4 in. (as measured to the midpoint of the roof – just over 30 ft. as measured to the peak of the ridge) and a footprint of 1,153 sq. ft.
- The house will be ‘street friendly’ including a front porch.
- The first floor will have 9 ft. ceilings; this is something expected in a new home.
- The proposed home is in the style of a farmhouse; similar to homes in the area.
- The house will include a covered front porch.

Exterior:

- Brick and lap siding;
- Combination of asphalt and metal roof;
- The trim will be simple flat stock;
- The windows will have appropriate muntins; and
- The garage will be detached and single story (no habitable attic) – at the rear of the yard.

Chairman Henke advised the applicant he will need to submit a site plan for both houses, where they sit, and where they are relative to the north and south neighbors (one page submittal). Board members further determined it would benefit the applicant if he initiated dialogue with the neighbors by discussing his plans with them.

The chairman commented he finds an issue given the massing of the proposed new house, even against the historic house, because of the height on both sides. Each lot is 43 ft. x 122 ft. Ms. Gehringer was also concerned with massing.

Mr. Willoughby thought it odd that half the house is brick and the other half is siding. Discussion continued regarding the design. Mr. Willoughby thought it would be helpful to have a third-floor plan.

Motion by Ms. Gehringer

Seconded by Mr. Coir to postpone the Preliminary Historic Design Review Application for 631 S. Bates.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Gehringer, Coir, Deyer, Dukas, Henke, Weisberg, Willoughby

Nays: None

Absent: None

05-15-14

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS

A. Staff Reports

- Administrative Approvals
 - 210 S. Old Woodward Ave., Suite 100, The Bird and the Bread - Change of restaurant name and modifications to sign design.
 - 270 W. Maple Rd., Beyond Juice - Re-paint of "Beyond Juice" lettering and replace logo with updated version.
 - 135 E. Maple Rd., Boyd - ???????
- Violation Notices (none)
- Demolition Applications
 - 2497 Dorchester
 - 1336 Humphrey
 - 23849 Forest Pk.
 - 660 Emmons
 - 752/754 Ann
 - 808 Bird
 - 663 Harmon
 - 1360 Northlawn
 - 783 Bennaville
 - 2244 Northlawn
 - 423 Berwyn
 - 2822 Dorchester
 - 1606 Humphrey
 - 610 Chester
 - 1125 Emmons
 - 532 Lakeside
 - 1620 Washington
 - 1710 Stanley

B. Communications

- Commissioners' Comments

Ms. Gehringer reminded everyone that the Greenwood Cemetery Advisory Committee will hold an open public meeting Thursday, May 8 at 7 p.m. in the Commission Room. The Committee's proposal, resolutions, and suggestions will be presented for the public to review.

Ms. Bashiri announced she will be leaving her position with the City by around June 13. Board members wished to take her to dinner on Monday, June 2.

05-16-14

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the board motioned to adjourn the meeting at 9:55 p.m.

Sheila Bashiri
City Planner

DRAFT